

Decolonising Spaces in Secondary Education: A Photovoice study with Black Learners at an
Ex Model-C School in Cape Town

Sarah Kew-Simpson

Department of Psychology

University of Cape Town

Supervisor: Shose Kessi

Word Count:

Abstract: 278 words

Main Body: 9 976 words

Plagiarism Declaration

1. I know that plagiarism is wrong. Plagiarism is to use another's work and to pretend that it is one's own.
2. I have used the APA convention for citation and referencing. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this essay from the work, or works, of other people has been acknowledged through citation and reference.
3. This report is my own work.
4. I have not allowed, and will not allow, anyone to copy my work with the intention of passing it off as his or her own work.

Signature

Date

Acknowledgements

Firstly, I would like to sincerely thank the participants in this study for your time, creativity and enthusiasm in sharing your stories.

I would like to thank Dr Shose Kessi at the University of Cape Town for supervising this study. Thank you for your enthusiasm about my project, your valuable insights, and for guiding me through this process.

Finally, thank you to my parents and to Robin for your constant love, support and patience throughout the year.

Abstract

Although ex Model-C schools in South Africa have become physically desegregated since the end of apartheid, black learners in these institutions continue to be affected by racism on a personal and an institutional level. The need for the transformation and decolonisation of spaces in secondary education is evidenced by recent protests amongst black learners at historically white high schools across the country. This research adopts both a postcolonial and a participatory approach towards understanding how black learners subjectively experience historically white schools. For this study, a photovoice project with seven black learners at an ex Model-C school in Cape Town was initiated in order to explore how black individuals enrolled in these schools depict their daily lives. Ultimately, the goal of this project was to inform and guide transformation efforts, and also to promote solidarity, agency and advocacy amongst the learners. The project consisted of focus group meetings in which the participants discussed their experiences, as well as the creation of photo-stories to visually depict these experiences. The resultant data was interpreted using a thematic analysis within the framework of postcolonial analysis. The findings indicated that the learners' daily experiences at their school could be divided into four different spheres: interpersonal racism; institutional racism; the intrapersonal effects of racism; and finally, ways of collective and individual resistance. The participants thus highlighted ways in which coloniality is maintained, but also ways in which it is resisted. Finally, some ideas generated by participants for ways in which racism could be addressed in historically white schools will be explored, and some suggestions for future research will be provided.

Keywords: Photovoice, ex Model-C, schools, secondary education, South Africa, race, decolonisation, transformation

With a rise in protest activity surrounding the de-colonisation of tertiary institutions, discourse regarding transformation in post-apartheid South Africa has rapidly become a focal point in academic literature. However, much of this research has primarily focused on historically white universities (see Cornell & Kessi, 2016). While it is important to interrogate these spaces, recent protest action by secondary school learners in ex Model-C schools indicates that it is of great importance to investigate the black¹ experience in these institutions too. It is counter-intuitive that research should focus on advocating for policy change in tertiary institutions whilst leaving the structure of secondary education un-interrogated. Although there is qualitative research on the black experience in historically white schools, the recent protest activity suggests that it has been ineffective in instigating meaningful policy change. Existing approaches have mostly relied on interview and observational data. However, these approaches have not been transformative enough in decolonising education. It seems a different method of data collection is required—one that privileges the first-hand experience of black learners over the external interpretations of researchers.

Nationwide Student Protest

Studies done at the University of Cape Town (UCT) prior to the student protests in 2015 indicated rising tension due to a lack of commitment to transformation on the part of the university (Cornell & Kessi, 2016). Black students felt that they were systematically excluded and alienated by the institution due to the Eurocentric nature of the curriculum, campus symbolism that devalued the black body, and persisting negative stereotypes of blackness (Cornell, Ratele, & Kessi, 2016; Cornell & Kessi, 2016; Kessi & Cornell, 2015). These tensions resulted in the Rhodes Must Fall protests of 2015, in which students demanded that the statue of the imperialist Cecil John Rhodes that was placed in a central position in front of UCT be taken down (Cornell et al., 2016).

The Rhodes Must Fall protests were followed by nationwide conversations on transformation in universities and subsequent decolonisation movements at other historically white institutions. Examples of such movements included TransformWits at the University of the Witwatersrand, OpenStellenbosch at Stellenbosch University, Shackville protests at UCT and the nationwide FeesMustFall protests, which continued into 2016 (Cornell et al., 2016; Cornell & Kessi, 2016). In recent news, this wave of protests has extended itself into secondary education, and has started to draw attention to institutionalised racism in ex Model-C high schools across the country.

Learners at Pretoria Girls' High School protested in August of 2016 against school policies that prohibited them from wearing their hair naturally (Pather, 2016). This was closely followed by protests at Sans Souci Girls' High School in Cape Town regarding prohibitive policies on language, hair and racism from staff in general (Staff Reporter, 2016). Since then, learner-driven conversation has continued at ex Model-C schools, questioning policies that seem inherently colonial and exclusionary. It seems then, that now is the ideal time for research to focus on the experiences of these individuals, so that change can take place before black learners have to resort to protest to make their voices heard.

Ex Model-C Schools in South Africa

The concept of the Model-C school emerged in 1990 when white-only schools were offered three models of desegregation (Carrim & Soudien, 1999). Either they could be privatised (Model A), remain state schools but have an open admissions policy (Model B), or they could become semi-private (Model C), with the state paying salaries but governing bodies paying for other expenses (Carrim & Soudien, 1999). In all models, the conditions were that 51% of the school remain white and the cultural ethos of the school was left intact. There was no obligation to give black learners financial aid or to provide adaptation programmes. In 1996, the South African Schools Act abolished the status of the Model-C school by making all schools either public or private (Carrim & Soudien, 1999). However, former Model-C schools were given special permission to retain a high level of authority over school policy. Due to their location in suburban areas, as well as their admissions criteria, these schools have remained mostly 'white' in both numbers and culture (Dolby, 2002).

Black Experience in Historically White Schools

Whilst the South African Schools Act allowed for physical desegregation, it did not consider the quality of the contact (Vandeyar, 2008). Zuma (2010), comments:

If a social psychological understanding and definition of segregation does not consider the conditions of existence and possibility (which in this case were conditions of injustice, inequality, impoverishment, violation, marginalisation and dehumanisation) of dominated people then an understanding of desegregation risks collapsing into a simplistic conceptualisation as intergroup mixing (p. 99).

When making strategies to address integration, these “conditions of existence” (Zuma, 2010, p. 99) must be taken into consideration— something that the South African education system neglected to do (Soudien, 2007). Ultimately, this limitation prevents schools from adequately engaging with issues experienced by black learners, and leaves them heavily affected by Apartheid’s legacy (Vandeyar, 2008). The following are some of the recurring themes discovered through qualitative research on black learners’ experiences in historically white schools.

Negative stereotypes. Multiple studies in South African ex Model-C schools and historically white universities, as well as schools in Britain and The United States, have indicated that black learners tend to internalise commonly held negative stereotypes about their intelligence and competence, which adversely affect their academic performance (Cornell & Kessi, 2016; Howarth, 2004; Kessi & Cornell, 2015; Phoenix, 2009; Soudien, 2007; Tatum, 1997; Vandeyar, 2008). The interpellation of these stereotypes may cause a self-fulfilling prophecy where students withdraw due to their own self-doubt—thereby unintentionally confirming the stereotypes (Howarth, 2004). Tatum (1997) also describes a perceived association between academic success and whiteness, which encourages black students to disengage from academic activities. Furthermore, white educators have often been documented to show less support to these students (Howarth, 2004; Vandeyar, 2008).

Interview data collected in South Africa by Vandeyar (2008) indicated that black learners tended to conform to the norms that their white educators projected onto them. Another interview study in Britain by Howarth (2004) further illustrates how preconceived notions of blackness can affect the learner-educator relationship. In the study, black schoolboys explained that one of the difficulties in challenging the stereotype of young black men as aggressive and anti-establishment is that any attempt to stand up to these attitudes would only confirm them in the minds of their educators. Negative stereotypes associated with blackness still persist at historically white schools, affecting the ways in which black learners are treated and informing the ways they act. The alienation of black students is further exacerbated by curricula that tend to leave them largely excluded.

Eurocentricity. Studies indicate that educators are unable and often unwilling to bring black history and non-western perspectives into the classroom (Howarth, 2004; McKinney, 2011). It seems that in many cases transformation is still thought of in terms of transforming a school’s racial demographics, and not necessarily in transforming a curriculum that still tends to come from a very westernized viewpoint (Cornell et al., 2016; Howarth, 2004). In South Africa, some attempt has been made to address Eurocentricity in

the curriculum by the inclusion of multiculturalism. However, although multiculturalism introduces students to different cultures, there is an absence of interrogation of the underlying power structures that exist in the reality of societal interaction (Vandeyar, 2008). Exclusion through curriculum denies black students recognition, a sense of self, and leaves them feeling devalued (Howarth, 2004). This sense of exclusion is intensified by a lack of black educators at these schools (Howarth, 2004; McKinney, 2010; Vandeyar, 2008).

There needs to be more engagement with what a transformed curriculum would entail— an endeavour that may be guided by better insight into black learners’ experiences within the existing curriculum. The focus on the Eurocentric is closely tied to the privileging of the English language in these institutions.

Language. At many schools, educators conflated ability to speak English with intelligence (McKinney, 2010; Phoenix, 2009; Vandeyar, 2008). In South Africa, most black learners are likely to speak English as an additional language. Such learners are thus doubly disadvantaged by having to understand learning material in a second language, as well as carry the burden of negative personal attributions to their level of proficiency (Vandeyar, 2008). In a study by McKinney (2013), black learners with accents different to that of a typical white, English South African, indicated that there is still stigmatization around these accents. However, even black learners who are highly proficient in English are stigmatized as ‘coconuts’—a label referring to black people who are viewed as “white on the inside” (McKinney, 2007, p. 17)—in their communities outside school, hindering their ability to interact with people in those settings (McKinney, 2007). Black learners are put in a position where they are expected to speak “white South African English” (McKinney, 2007, p. 8) in school environments, but must remain ‘black’ in their home environments (McKinney, 2007). There is thus an unfair burden placed on black learners to assimilate to their setting, or face being rejected. In schools particularly, there are many ways in which social relations may force black learners to assimilate into a dominant culture.

Assimilation and identity. Soudien (2007) argues that assimilation occurs when black learners give up their culture in favour of one that has been positioned as superior, ultimately leaving them with a sense of devaluation. Instead of the dominant social order changing to incorporate black learners, black learners are often expected to change and incorporate themselves into this order. Assimilation is achieved through disciplinary measures which refuse to engage with pupils’ cultural and social contexts (McKinney, 2010), as well as through invoking imagined connections between Whiteness and being a ‘global’ subject, as opposed to an African one (Soudien, 2007). Essentially, black learners are left

torn between two contradictory identities— yet those who try to resist the process of assimilation are labelled as problematic (Soudien, 2010; Vandeyar, 2008). It is thus easier for black learners to assimilate into the existing order than to raise concerns about it.

Limitations of the Current Body of Research.

Although interview and observational research in high schools has not been successful in instigating change, Participatory Action Research (PAR) conducted at the University of Cape Town has resulted in findings that, by comparison, have contributed meaningfully to conversations about transforming higher education (Cornell et al., 2016; Cornell & Kessi, 2016; Kessi & Cornell, 2015). In high schools, research on black learners' experiences has relied too much on researchers' own interpretations. More research is needed into the day-to-day, lived experiences of black learners. Research that is more closely guided by first-hand appraisals of their needs and concerns, rather than those made by researchers. It seems then that it may be valuable for the PAR approach to be replicated in secondary education settings, where it can be tangibly used to advocate for institutional change. PAR has the potential to benefit both the institutions, which will gain valuable insight needed to inform future policy and practice, as well as the participants, who will be given a means to take agency over their situation and work as advocates for change.

Aims and Research Questions

Aims

The broad objective of this study is to investigate the ways in which black learners subjectively experience attending historically white secondary schools. This research aims to gain insights into the first-hand experiences and needs of black learners at these schools in order to actively include their voices in dialogue about their own lives, and to guide future transformation efforts. Ultimately, it is hoped that this project will engage learners and staff in critical thought and conversation about transformation, as well as form links between learners and important stakeholders.

Main Research Question

How do black learners depict their daily experiences at ex Model-C schools?

Sub-Questions

- What overarching themes are present in the experiences of black learners at historically white schools?
- What elements of school life do black learners in these schools find exclusionary?
- What elements of school life do black learners in these schools enjoy?
- What representations do black learners have of themselves in an institution that is predominantly white?

Methodology

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework for this study is that of critical social psychology. This psychological tradition is concerned with challenging social practices that contribute to inequality, being critical of how Psychology can be used for oppression, and also considering its potentially transformative power (Hook, 2005). Critical social psychology attempts more than just analysis—it seeks to address the inequalities it identifies (Hook, 2005).

Specifically, this research assumes a postcolonial approach towards critical psychology. Postcolonial theory is grounded in the belief that the racialised power relations established between colonized and colonizers continue to influence social structures today (MacLeod, Bhatia, & Kessi, 2017). The postcolonial approach aims to problematise and intervene in the colonial discourses that normalize inequality (Hook, 2005; Kessi, 2013). It is preoccupied with the notion that politics and Psychology are inherently linked, as Psychology is heavily reliant on its socio-political and historical context (Hook, 2005). This perspective also grapples with how Psychology may be used as a progressive political tool in order to consolidate resistance (Hook, 2005). Psychology that promotes critical consciousness about conditions of inequality and collective action could be used to unite marginalized groups of people, and provide them with tools for empowerment (Kessi, 2013). Thus, postcolonial critical psychology aims to tie the discipline to objectives that are political and emancipatory (Hook, 2005).

Research Design

Participatory Action Research (PAR). PAR is a form of research in which the participants play an active role in both the gathering and analyzing of data alongside the researchers (Brydon-Miller, 1997; Kessi, 2013). PAR focuses on traditionally marginalized

communities, and places an emphasis on transforming knowledge into social change (Brydon-Miller, 1997). In PAR, action is equally as important as the results, and the knowledge of participants is privileged over that of the researcher—thereby assuming that communities are experts with regard to their own needs (Kessi, 2013). The researcher’s role is not to guide research, but to facilitate critical discussion and community action (Kessi, 2013).

Photovoice. Photovoice is PAR method developed by Wang and Burris (1997). It describes a community-based photographic technique whereby individuals are given cameras and are asked to narrate photo-stories revolving around particular themes in their lives (Wang & Burris, 1997). Photovoice aims to enable participants to reflect their lives visually, promote critical dialogue about issues in their communities, and reach policy-makers, thereby allowing them to work as agents for change in their own communities (Wang & Burris, 1997). Photovoice also illuminates issues that may otherwise have been missed by researchers who are outsiders to community life (Wang & Burris, 1997).

Photovoice has been used successfully in a number of youth settings across South Africa, covering a variety of issues including safety promotion in low-income areas (Suffla, Kaminer, & Bawa, 2012), adolescent sexuality (Zway & Boonzaier, 2015), representations of masculinity (Langa, 2010), and in critically investigating beliefs about development (Kessi, 2011). Wang (2006) argues that youth participation in Photovoice encourages better intergenerational partnerships, and enables a largely underrepresented age demographic to express their concerns. The emphasis placed by Photovoice methodology on acquiring first-hand knowledge, its explicit focus on action, and its success in stimulating youth engagement makes it ideal for the research aims of this study.

Participants and Recruitment

The participants were seven black learners at a unisex ‘all-boys’, ex Model-C school in Cape Town, South Africa. Five of the learners were in grade 11, and two were in grade 10. Two of the participants resided in the school boarding house, and the remaining five resided at home. There were originally eight learners involved, but one dropped out after phase two of data collection. The overall homogeneity in age of the learners was useful in that it made the participants more comfortable with each other in a focus group context, and in that all of the participants had already spent a significant amount of time engaging with the racial dynamics at the school.

The racial demographic of the school is majority white (68%)² with an increasing black population (32%). Participants were sampled purposively through the school's Civic Engagement Society and recruited in an information session during one of their meetings. In this session they were briefed about the principles of Photovoice, the broad aims of the project and what participation would entail. Those who were interested took home a consent form to be signed by the learners and their parents/guardians (Appendix A).

Data Collection and Procedure

The data collection took place over various phases. In total it consisted of six meetings, each facilitated by myself. These were held at the participants' school at a time of their convenience so that there were not additional travel costs incurred. All of the focus groups were audio-recorded and transcribed. Throughout the entire process, I kept a diary in which I documented field notes to enhance my analysis.

Phase 1: Focus Group 1 (Appendix B). The first phase of data collection entailed participants engaging in an hour-long focus group. Participants who had parental consent handed in their consent forms at the beginning of the meeting. This was followed by a discussion about how it is to be a black learner in a predominantly white institution. The discussion was open-ended, and aimed to generate critical thinking about the learners' experiences (Wang, 2006). As the facilitator, I had a few prompts for discussion, but tried to be as flexible as possible, and tried to not guide the conversation (Wang & Redwood-Jones, 2001).

Phase 2: Photo Training. The participants attended a workshop with a trained photographer. This workshop aimed to expand their knowledge of photography and encourage creativity, but not lead participants to take certain kinds of pictures (Wang & Burris, 1997). It involved a lengthy conversation on issues of ethics and representation, as well as ways in which photographs could be used to tell a story. At the end of this session, participants were given cameras and left with an idea of how their photo-stories would take form.

Phase 3: Photo Production. Participants were given two weeks to take their photos and write their photo-stories. They were required to select a maximum of five photos that they felt best represented their story.

Phase 4: Focus Groups 2 and 3 (Appendix C). After the learners had compiled their photo stories, two 45-minute focus groups were held in which participants presented their

photo stories to each other. In each meeting, there was a discussion on recurring themes, and possible ways in which the participants could engage in action as a school community.

Phase 5: Exhibition Planning. Due to the fact that the learners needed to start preparing for their end of year exams, an exhibition could not be held before the writing of this report. However, a photographic exhibition is in the process of being planned for the beginning of December in which the participants will invite various stakeholders in the school and local community to see their photo-stories.

Data Analysis

The data consisted of transcribed focus group discussions, photo-stories, and field notes made throughout the process. This data was analysed through a thematic analysis (TA). TA is a method of identifying and analysing recurrent themes in qualitative data (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

Although postcolonial research often adopts critical poststructuralist methods of analysis (Macleod et al., 2017), I chose TA due to the participant-driven focus of photovoice research. Thematic analysis is a very accessible way to evaluate data, as it does not require a deep understanding of any particular technical knowledge (Braun & Clarke, 2006), making it a good tool for encouraging participant involvement in analyzing the data. TA thus fits in well with the aim of photovoice to position participants as experts on their lives by privileging their perspectives. TA is also not attached to any particular theoretical framework, and can be used in a variety of methodologies and theoretical approaches (Braun & Clarke, 2006).

Although there are no set rules for how to conduct TA, I based my analysis off the guidelines provided by Braun and Clarke (2006). Firstly, I coded and collated the entire data set. I then arranged the coded data into broader themes that represented important patterns in the participants' daily experiences at their school. These themes (See Table 1) have been discussed in the findings from a postcolonial perspective.

Table 1

Outline of Themes Used in Analysis

Theme	Subthemes
1. Interpersonal racism	1. Racist-name calling 2. Stereotyping black people 3. Negative associations with blackness
2. Institutional racism	1. Racism in the physical institution 2. Racism in the cultural institution
3. Intrapersonal effects of racism	1. Authentic identity vs. school identity 2. Negative affect 3. Assimilation
4. Collective and individual resistance	1. Self-affirmation 2. Alternative spaces for solidarity and resistance

Ethical Considerations

This study was granted Ethical approval by the Ethics Committee of the University of Cape Town.

Consent and Confidentiality

Informed consent was obtained from all participants, as well as from their parents or guardians. They also gave written consent to be recorded in focus groups, and for their photos to be used for research purposes. It was made clear that participants could withdraw from the study at any given time, and that it is their choice whether they will participate in the exhibition or not.

Since sensitive issues were discussed in the focus groups, the assurance of anonymity was important in creating an environment where participants could speak freely without fear of victimization. However, many of the participants indicated that they did not want their identities to be erased in the report or in the photographs. Although the participants were legal minors, most of them will turn 18 within the next year. For this reason, pseudonyms were used only where they were requested. If this report is published at any stage, the matter will be revisited.

Photography Ethics

The training workshop educated participants on photo-ethics, and appealed to them for voluntary adherence to this. Participants learned how to obtain consent for taking photographs of others, and how to avoid taking photographs that may be disrespectful or embarrassing. Identifying features of individuals in photographs who were not a part of the study were removed from the data.

Benefits and Risks

Potential benefits to the participants included feelings of empowerment and a means of having their voices heard in a unique way. They also received free photography training to further develop their skills. Participants were briefed on safety when taking photographs, but since they were in a safe school environment, there was minimal risk to their physical safety. There was a chance that some participants may have found the nature of the subject matter distressing, in which case, they would have been referred to school counseling services. However, none of the participants expressed being negatively affected by the project.

Reflexivity

Even in PAR, the dynamic between the researcher and the participants is something that must be continually reflected on. The politics of location located within the research encounter should always be acknowledged and interrogated. This includes: the theoretical and political positioning of researchers; ways in which the researcher is an insider or an outsider to the participants; and the imperialism of research itself (Macleod et al., 2017). As a white, female, university student and researcher, I needed to be aware of how my location would affect the relationship with the participants, who were all black, male, school learners. Although difference is a mostly inescapable part of the research encounter, it may have affected how comfortable students felt discussing issues about race that they know I have not experienced. In order to address this, I tried as much as possible explicitly position myself as the pupil, and the participants as teachers. Howarth (2002) suggests that difference represented in this way may not only address power imbalances, but also prompt participants to think more critically as they have to explain their life to an outsider.

Furthermore, PAR blurs the boundaries of research, as participants partake in the role of researcher (Wang & Burris, 1997). The participants were involved in both the creation and analyzing of data, thus reducing the danger of me overwriting their narrative during the research process.

Findings and Discussion

The TA identified four ways in which the participants' daily encounters with coloniality at their school are experienced and negotiated. These were through: interpersonal racism; institutional racism; the intrapersonal effects of racism; and finally, ways of collective and individual resistance. This analysis will examine how the learners depicted their lives in each of these spheres.

Interpersonal Racism

The participants in the study experienced racism through daily interactions with white learners and educators. These can be categorized into racist-name calling, stereotyping of black people, and negative associations with blackness.

Racist name-calling. The participants spoke of incidences where derogatory words were used to describe them. For instance, the learners noted an educator who has been “*known to call Muslim boys Pakistanis and call a black guy the K-word*” (Seth, FG1). One participant, Seth, also spoke of a recent incident in which a voice-note from a white learner using the ‘K’-word was sent to a Whatsapp group that he was a part of:

I just remember seeing people apologising saying, “no Seth, (...) it wasn’t directed at you” (...) And then I heard the voice-note and I was shocked and disgusted by it.

(Seth, FG1)

Participants also spoke of forms of racist name-calling that were deemed socially acceptable by fellow learners:

Chumani: *The word coconut can be quite as clear just in terms of, ‘you are not like other black people’, or you know the, the circle.*

Sarah: *Yes.*

Sanga: *Also like ja, there are a lot of labels in school (...) for us black people, like ‘zaaks’, or ‘zal’.*

Hlonela: *It’s not offensive, it’s just getting uncomfortable. (FG1)*

There was a general consensus that words like ‘zaak’ and ‘zal’ made it easier for people at school to be racist, as they could avoid using more socially prohibited words to do so:

It’s convenient for white guys that use the K word (...) because like now they can use

'zaak' in the same way, except now it's cool. (Hlonela, FG1)

Stereotyping of black people. The participants expressed that white learners and educators frequently categorized black learners based on assumptions about the way black people are:

Sanga: *Like let's say I'd come late for something, someone like a white guy, okay any guy, they'll be like "ahh, that's such a zaak thing to do."*

Sarah: *Oh.*

Chumani: *So you have a white person telling you how to be a black person. Their idea of a black person, which is mostly not correct.*

Hlonela: *Like remember, we were at [a rugby match] and all the black guys would just dance, dance. But if he's sitting and not dancing, then you not a zaak.*

Chumani: *Assuming that dancing makes you black. Whereas it really doesn't. (FG1)*

The idea that black people should dance bears similarities to a study by Howarth (2004) in which it was found that black learners were pushed into doing activities associated with objectifying notions of blackness, such as dancing, music and sport. Seth described another situation in which his race was stereotyped in a derogatory manner on the sports field:

... At hockey practice two weeks ago, there was one of the UCT parties and (...) they were going over a mega phone and swearing and drinking and stuff. So we were like, okay let's go see what's happening, so we're walking there and then the guy says, "ja it looks like one of those zal parties"—which they call 'zal' coloured people. And I'm walking with them and I said, like, what do you mean? And then he was like, "oh no like a dodgy party." So he's basically using the term zal as like a synonym for dodgy. (Seth, FG1)

Yondipha represents the idea of essentialising and homogenizing blackness in the following photo (Photograph 1) that was taken at the celebration of his brother's circumcision—an event to which educators and peers from school were invited:

The blackened face could be symbolic of how people look at black culture. They don't look at it as individuals—they just look at this individual as a product of this culture. Not really "who is this individual?" (Yondipha, FG3)

Furthermore, the participants suggested that often, black learners begin to internalise the stereotypes given to them:

The other day my one friend (...) he came late, and then I was like “why did you take so long?” He was like ja, it’s standard, I’m a zaak. (...) Some of us it’s almost like we falling into conforming to the stereotypes that are like labeled upon us, like ja I’ll be late for class (...) You feel like you should be adhering to these like labels that are given to us. (Sanga, FG1)

This statement echoes the Fanonian notion of internalisation, which refers to the assimilation of socio-political and historical reality into the internal reality of the oppressed subject, where it becomes viewed as subjective fact (Hook, 2004). The internalisation of negative stereotypes about incompetence has also been observed in other studies in university and school settings (Cornell & Kessi, 2016; Howarth, 2004; Phoenix, 2009; Vandeyar, 2008). However, the participants were critical of fellow black learners who internalized, and thereby participated in reinforcing stereotypes:

When we as black people are gonna say stuff like that then what do you expect white people to say (...) Now imagine you, a Black person who is Black saying it compared to someone who thinks Black men are actually inferior. Imagine how much worse it’s going to come out, and you’re going to kind of like team up with them, if you know what I mean? (Chumani, FG1)

Ansaar raised the idea of categorizing black learners into ways of being that are deemed acceptable by the school:

(...) Model-C schools do a good job of kind of grouping black or coloured people into one specific area of confinement (...) So for example, like Ubuntu—that’s like seen as the black society. Like soccer, you don’t really have many white people playing, it’s

just seen as the black and coloured sport. Everyone wants to put you in this kind contained unit of either being black, or being this, or being whatever. (Ansaar, FG2)

This idea is expressed in one of Ansaar's photo-series: *Contained* (Photo-series 1).

Caption: Many black bodies will feel trapped and confined within the multitude of restrictions that schools place on us. Specifically with regards to our expression of our cultures and identities

Negative associations with blackness. In the focus groups, it was discussed how white people tend to equate racial diversity in schools with low standards—thus perpetuating the idea that blackness is associated with a lack of excellence and ability.

Chumani: *(...) Predominantly white thought is (...) the blacker something is the worse it is (...) that's how they've been taught from a colonialist's point of view to think.*

Hlonela: *Even black people think it. (FG1)*

Tatum (1997) documented a similar perceived link between notions of academic success and whiteness. Interestingly, Yondipha proposed that such a way of thinking about racially diverse schools becomes a self-fulfilling prophecy. He suggests it encourages parents to withdraw their children, and subsequently their funds, which may lead to the school's deterioration:

We have to remember the majority are white people (...) and once there's been this big revolution, all of a sudden it's not the same thing it was (...) So I am not going to take my child there. And the school funds come from school fees, so the moment people don't bring their children here this school will begin to devalue. (Yondipha, FG1)

Fanon (1963) argued that imposing representations of inferiority onto colonised subjects is essential to the colonization process, as it serves to justify their subjugation. As Hlonela suggests above, black people come to view themselves through these colonial representations. The representation of blackness as substandard can thus be linked directly to coloniality.

In addition to racism on an individual level, learners also experienced racism on the level of the institution itself.

Institutional Racism

Racism does not occur only as a result of individual attitudes, but also because of “systemic, subtle, and pervasive forms of disadvantage built into institutional processes and practices” (Baez, 2000, p. 335). In this section, institutional racism has been divided into two categories— racism entrenched in the physical institution, and racism entrenched in the cultural institution.

Racism in the physical institution. Racism from the physical institution refers to the structural elements of the school that were identified as problematic by the participants— namely school policy, and the lack of commitment to action.

Policy. A key concern expressed by participants was the perceived fairness of the admissions policy. On the application form, learners are asked about whether they have familial connections to the school. The prime concern was that this puts black learners who are applying in a disadvantaged position:

On your application it is asked if you had [family connections to the school], but then how are people of colour then, what can they put there because their parents weren't allowed to go to the school, so that's like an institutionalised form of racism (Seth, FG1)

Even though it is not formalized in the school admission policy that having family who went to the school will improve chances of admission, the fact that it is on the application form was viewed as a problematic precedent with which the school has been unwilling to engage:

(...) We could state that asking: was your brother at [the school]— why are you asking that question? We tried to explain to them, say that's wrong. (...) Once we have reached a conclusion okay this is wrong you have to get rid of it. They'll say, “No you can't just tear down tradition”. (Yondipha, FG1)

Another feature of the admissions policy that was deemed problematic was the concept soft zoning. Governmental legislation outlines that preference for acceptance into public schools must be given to applicants who live within the demarcated boundaries of that school's allocated feeder zone, which usually only covers the areas that are directly adjacent to it (Sayed, 1999). The soft zoning policy is problematic for schools situated in historically white areas, as it constrains diversification of admissions by privileging the residents of these areas— who tend to be mostly white due to the unequal racial geography of South Africa (Sayed, 1999).

Lack of commitment to action. It was frequently expressed that management seemed to lack commitment to taking action towards transformation. There was a sense that when issues are raised, the school's management talks about solving them, but does not take any

further steps.

They'll say like okay we'll fix this, blah, blah, blah and we'll call you back for a meeting (...) and then three months later you're still waiting for a meeting. And it goes to the end of the year and you still haven't had a meeting. (Chumani, FG1)

Racism in the cultural institution. The cultural institution refers to collective ways of being that have been in place since the conception of the school— dating back to the colonial era. They are often not specific to the participants' school, but ex Model-C schools in general. Although these barriers are not enforced through written policy, they are equally difficult to overcome due to how deeply entrenched they are in school culture.

Ansaar's photo-series, *Beginning* (Photo-series 2), suggests that the gravity of the school's culture extends beyond the physical institution itself, to the point where learners can interact with the school before they have even arrived.

Caption: *This group shows the process by which all black students start their journey. Through the act of getting dressed we start to become part of the system that oppresses us.*

The participants discussed cultural oppression with regards to a collective resistance to accommodating diversity, superficial notions of ‘brotherhood’, and a disproportionately strong emphasis on school image.

Collective resistance to accommodating diversity. The discourse of tradition was identified as a way in which transformation is evaded. The participants expressed that whilst the school is willing to change tradition in some instances, the school community is quick to use the rhetoric of tradition to defend practices that black learners identify as problematic:

The school’s argument is that traditions do have to change after a while, but now when we want change (...) they just say no, traditions cannot change. (Sanga, FG1)

Discourses of school prestige were also used in a similar silencing manner to avoid engaging with issues:

[The school] is very prestigious, I’m not going to lie. Like, we are lucky to be here and that’s made very clear by teachers (...) We’ll have a discussion, almost an argument, with the teacher on something we don’t agree on, and he would be like— “If you don’t agree on this there are many other schools, you can go to another school.” (Yondipha, FG1)

McKinney (2010) argues that the ‘accept-or-leave’ threat mentioned above stems from racist discourse that suggests that black learners would be better suited to under-resourced, less prestigious schools elsewhere.

The overall lack of willingness educators show towards accommodating diversity is further indicated in an example discussed by Chumani about a teacher who refused to let black learners practice the cultural norm of shaving their hair off because: “*We don’t want skinheads here*” (FG3) Sanga made the comment that:

It’s an ego thing (...) That’s why I think people (...) have this attitude towards like change, these changes. Because of their egos, because of the way they’ve been living their lives, when they think they suddenly rejected, because they’ve been thinking that it’s right the whole time. We need to kind of change the environment at [the school] to be more accepting, not just to black people or people of colour. Just like (...) —“if you’re not this way then [the school] is not for you”—that’s how I feel it is (Sanga, FG1)

A photo taken by Hlonela (Photograph 2) depicts how intolerance to diversity extends beyond the classroom and onto the sports grounds.

Hlonela described being sidelined by his water polo team because of the general tendency by white teammates and parents to view black sportsman as unworthy members of the team:

There's definitely an exclusive white culture (...) being black in that sport we were already viewed as like the quotas, and like we're only there to make it seem like the team isn't only white, and they're more accepting of people from other races, but it's like kind of a cover up. And then like, when we would make a mistake, they'd be like, "oh that's why I don't like the quota system" and stuff. Versus someone else, they'd be like, "it's just a bad day". So that's why I wanted to show my suffocation. Because like, your self-esteem suffocates, your confidence suffocates, and like you get confused, man. You buy into the fact that you actually aren't good enough. And they make it seem like it's not a skin thing, but it makes you think about like— if you were white... (Hlonela, FG2)

Superficial notions of brotherhood. The rhetoric of 'brotherhood' was something that came up often in discussion. To the participants, the brand of brotherhood reinforced by the school community was seen as hollow. Chumani remarked:

That brotherhood thing—I hate it so much. They'll say brotherhood this, brotherhood that (...) they only use this brotherhood thing, most of the time at least, for when it's actually convenient for them. You know you'll never see them using it (...) for when they wanna actually learn about black cultures for example, or when they want to go

to Ubuntu cultural evenings. You never see them saying, okay ja so brotherhood. But as soon as we have to stick up for a teacher that calls someone the K-word, who still hasn't been fired, then it's apparently a brotherhood this and a brotherhood that. And when we go to a first team rugby match then we must cheer (...) (Chumani, FG3).

This sentiment was further reflected by the following interaction:

Ansaar: You come in as outsider, you come in as the other (...) Coming in as a black person, a person of colour, you're such a small minority, and even though you can band together with other people, in the whole, in the bigger picture, when it comes to brotherhood (...) you'll always be the other, the visitor. You know you'll always be the attraction at chants, you know, when the black kids start dancing.

Sarah: It's like a spectacle?

Ansaar: It's a spectacle for them.

Chumani: But then when you're done dancing...

Ansaar: They don't care about you. (FG2)

The call for brotherhood was looked on with skepticism, as it was perceived to be a rhetorical tool used only when it was convenient for white learners. Seldom would brotherhood be used as a motivation for white learners to learn about their black 'brothers', or to take a stand against racism.

Emphasis on image. Participants frequently commented the prioritising of school image over the well being of the learners:

Seth: I think that inevitably comes down to something that I think we all agree with, and that it's not just our school in particular, but standard white model-C schools— they really just care about their image. So it's all just about what other people see them as, so they'd rather, I don't know, they would rather care about things like how the first team rugby field will look or something like that rather than care about the internal issues, like within the school. That's why there's so many cases (...) when teachers say promises and stuff and eventually they don't meet up. Kind of shut up, swept under the rug because we don't want to deal with it. It's not affecting the face of the school. That's why like in recent times with things like that voice-note that came out, then that's when now the school all of a sudden like in assembly will speak on racism and stuff like that. Only when it kind of, when it's a...

Hlonela: When they have no choice.

Seth: Ja when they have no choice, when it's kind of affecting their image.

(FG1)

Seth went on to further detail the stigma he experienced when the aforementioned racist voice-note he was sent got out to the mainstream media. Even though it was not him that exposed the school, there was still aggression directed at him—the victim—for ruining the school's image, rather than the perpetrators of the act.

(...) So I would walk down the corridor and I could feel the tension with me of people like just staring at me. There was one guy came to me the morning after the media, one guy came to me and like he pushed me back. Like he tried to get me to the wall and he was just like, was it your dad who got out to the media? (...) The hatred was more directed at the people who fought up against it and 'snitched', if that's the word that you want to use, rather than the actual people who committed the crime. (Seth, FG1)

Chumani chose to focus on the idea of image in his photo-series (Photo-series 3).

With these photographs, Chumani highlights:

I'm unmistakably in the photo— but the focus is on [the school's logo] (...) You're kind of in the way of things (...) They exist in this bubble which is so out of touch with reality and how things actually go on in the world (...) A lot of superficial things are kind of the important things. Like, it's more important to important to play 1st team rugby than to actually be someone who cares that people are being treated equally. You know, it's more important to be playing first team hockey than to care how we treat females from [neighboring girls' school]. (FG3)

Black learners do not only experience the effects of racism in their external environments, but also in their internal realities. The next section explores this.

The Intrapersonal Effects of Racism

The combination of racism from an individual and institutional level has a number of psychological effects on black learners. This theme is of significant importance, as it indicates where the burden of racism in schools is most strongly felt.

Authentic identity versus school identity. A few of the participants communicated a sense of conflict between their authentic identity and the identity they are forced to have in order to succeed in their school environment:

Chumani: *Because at the end of the day, (...) when you go back to the townships, (...) You think in ways that like okay, this one is trying to say an English word to me like yes, you know his English is really bad. You know, things that you weren't previously saying. (...) Now you are going to go to an environment where you came from, an environment that's kind of, how do I say it? Authentic you. And you are going to go make fun of that. Which you learned from here (Chumani: FG1)*

Chumani's example of the tension between speaking English at school and in the townships has been highlighted by McKinney (2007, 2013) who argues that black learners are made to value English over African languages at school, but do the opposite when at home.

Yondipha's photo-series (See photographs 3 and 4) contrasts the restriction of school life with the freedom felt at his home in the Eastern Cape by him and his family. The Eastern Cape represents a place in which the authentic self is unrestrained.

This right here is a ceremony just after my grandma had passed away. I picked this picture because my theme was freedom. The freedom I feel in Eastern Cape. You can see over here (...) my mom is barefoot, she doesn't have anything on her hair done... It's not really stylish or anything. It's just almost like she's one with the environment, and there's no like restrictions or limitations she has to adhere to. No subtle boundaries that you have to conform to. (Yondipha, FG3)

This right here is the latest house that was put in our village. And just after I'd taken it, it just felt so beautiful. It's almost like there's no clear roads or anything or boundaries (...) It ties with my theme—it's that in the Eastern Cape it's almost like (...) a person is a person because of the person next to them. (Yondipha, FG3)

Negative affect. Participants verbalised feelings of negative affect brought on by interactions with whiteness. This involved feelings of inner conflict, discomfort and alienation:

So it is (...) another like internal conflict because you, you do feel that you are lucky to be here and your parents have worked hard for you to be here. At the same time you are not really feeling comfortable, you don't know if you should speak out.

(Yondipha, FG1)

White people make it obvious when they're uncomfortable, they don't really realize how the (...) African kids feel like this all the time. (Sanga, FG3)

I feel like it's very hard for any oppressed minority in these white spaces to feel at home, and then see where you are being oppressed. (Chumani, FG3)

The following are two photo-series created by Ansaar that represent some of the feelings expressed in these extracts (Photo-series 4 and 5).

Caption: *As a black body in a predominantly white space, we almost always feel as the other, the visitor, someone who will never belong. That is wrong and we should take a firm stand against this.*

Caption: *This shows how as a black student, we all go through a phase of questioning everything around us. We question ourselves, our identity and our place in this white space.*

These findings of intrapersonal distress coincide with the writings of Fanon (1967) who highlighted the state of psychological anxiety associated with racial oppression. This state of dissonance emerges due to a dominant culture that is hostile to the culture of the oppressed (Hook, 2005).

Assimilation. The idea of assimilation was represented throughout the photo-stories in various ways. However, the participants did not view themselves as passive victims—they represented themselves as active agents in a process that they have the power to either partake in, or to resist. **This** choice is depicted in Ansaar’s photo-series: *Decisions* (Photo-series 6).

Caption: *These images shows the two choices many black students will face when dealing with the institution: assimilate or rebel.*

Seth's photo-story is a visual depiction of assimilation in action. Yet it also expressed that, in the process of resistance, black learners are made stronger by solidarity with fellow black learners (Photo-series 7).

Caption: For this project I have chosen to comment on the role of brotherhood amongst people of colour in institutions that are generally catered towards a white demographic. The tie in these photos symbolizes the institution and how it makes situations more difficult towards those who don't fit its preconceived mold. The white paint then symbolizes conformity, by means of people of colour abandoning their heritage and cultural backgrounds in order to survive in this particular environment. Needless to say these photos portray how brotherhood amongst members of the same groups are brought into light during these situations mentioned

Fanon saw colonialism as not only an appropriation of land, but also an appropriation of mind and culture (Hook, 2005). In postcolonial terms, this entails the forced replacement of the culture of colonized subjects, with a culture that is anti-black (Hook, 2005). Seth's photo-story depicts a scene in which the appropriation of the subject's physical body leads to his psychological demise.

However, the depictions of defiance and brotherhood shown in the two photo-series above indicate that the participants do not consider themselves passive victims.

Ways of Collective and Individual Resistance

Throughout discussion, participants indicated an active engagement in resisting racism and opposing coloniality.

Positive self-affirmation. The importance of not allowing one's identity to be defined by others was emphasised on a number of occasions.

(...) I agree that it is much better to be happy in who you are even if it leads to you being rejected sometimes (...) Even though it might be hard. (Chumani, FG1)

(...) By trying to go against those kind of maybe traditions and cultures, you are then not being yourself and that's what, that, you are letting them win, them whoever it is. (Yondipha, FG1)

Ansaar also depicts positive self-affirmation in the following photo-series (Photo-series 8):

Caption: These images depict the idea of owning our identity and how it gives us power.

These learners are mobilizing the key strategies for political and social emancipation, according to Biko's Black Consciousness Movement (Hook, 2004). Throughout the project, they indicated being actively engaged with a critical consciousness of their own oppression, and also, as these findings suggest, creating both affirming and positive representations of blackness, thereby empowering themselves to resist oppression.

Finding alternative spaces. Another important idea raised was finding alternative spaces for solidarity and freedom within the school context. For their photo-series, Sanga and Mihle got one of their fellow boarding house peers to take photographs of them at the Ubuntu cultural evening (See photographs 5, 6 and 7). This is an event where the school's Ubuntu society gets together with other schools to showcase their culture in an evening of song, dance and poetry. Sanga describes how the Ubuntu cultural evening provides a space in which he can escape the oppression of everyday school life, and find solidarity with other black learners:

Even though we a minority in the school, we still, like when we get together in the Ubuntu cultural evenings (...) we still try and express ourselves as much as we can (...) Even though we're still in the school, we're getting away from the normal school. So you can see how everyone is looking so happy and into it. I don't know, it feels like when you're with people you can relate to (...) even though you're not at home, you feel like you're at home somehow, like you've got that freedom. So that's what I really like about the Ubuntu society (...) I know it shouldn't be that way, I mean Ubuntu means that you are a person because of another person, but because of the exclusivity of the school (...) small things like this are where you can really express yourself as a Xhosa or a black kid. Even though the school goes on about brotherhood, it feels like a brotherhood in this society (Sanga, FG3).

Biko maintained that the conditions of oppression brought people together in solidarity and resistance, thereby allowing them to identify with themselves (see Hook, 2004). The alternative space offered by the Ubuntu cultural society is one such place where unrestrained identity can be expressed, and blackness can be collectively celebrated. Sanga expressed how the Ubuntu cultural evening is a place where black solidarity is reinforced, as black learners from multiple schools around Cape Town are able to come together and share their thoughts:

You can relate to all of these people (...) you can see that some of them bear the same sentiment that we do. (Sanga, FG3)

Identifying spaces of resistance, freedom and solidarity is equally as important as identifying oppression, as they illustrate the ways in which coloniality is already being opposed, and resists representation of individuals as passive victims.

The participants in this study have moved beyond the point of internalization, and have developed an awareness of the conditions that maintain their oppression in their school

environment. The next step in the process of decolonisation is to find ways in which to transform these observations into action that promotes structural and social change.

Conclusion

Summary of Findings

Analysis of the data indicated that there are four broad spheres in which coloniality is experienced in historically white secondary schools. Firstly, racism is experienced in daily interpersonal interactions, through the denigration and devaluation of blackness by white peers and educators. These interactions negatively affected the types of relationships that the participants had with other individuals, and their overall socialization in the school.

Beyond the level of personal attitudes, participants experienced racism on an institutional level. Institutional racism came from physical school policy and management, as well as from the overall ex Model-C school culture. These factors acted as important barriers for meaningful change.

Racism did not only have an impact on the participants' external reality, but also exposed them to significant psychological stressors. As the participants processed and negotiated racism, they had to come to terms with conflicting identities and emotions.

Ultimately, despite these negative experiences, the participants actively drew on their existing resources to seek out places for engagement, solidarity and freedom. Although faced with many external barriers, the participants made the decision to rebel against coloniality and oppression, and resist victimhood.

Limitations

The participants were drawn from only one school, and from learners who were members of a school society that was already engaged in social issues. They may thus not be representative of all black learners at ex Model-C schools. However, since this research is exploratory and intended to promote discussion and guide future efforts, it is enough to rely on findings being validated by the participants' shared experiences (Wang & Burris, 1997).

Furthermore, this study took place in an all-boys school, and the results cannot be generalized to all-girls, or co-ed schools, where experiences will be gendered in different ways. Similar PAR should be performed in these contexts in order to investigate the qualitative differences in experiences.

It could also be argued that the use of term ‘black’ to encompass all oppressed races could lead to the erasure of particular intersections of identity. However, it seemed that, although there were a few differences, the learners’ shared most experiences. They also indicated a sense of solidarity against racism amongst themselves despite these differences.

Contributions and Implications of the Study

The ultimate aim of the study was to gain insight into the lived experiences of black learners at historically white schools, by utilising research methods that emphasised collaboration, and privileged participants’ knowledge and understandings.

Participants were given the opportunity to voice their concerns in a creative manner that promoted critical thinking, and provided a means for self-empowerment (Wang, 2006). Although the exhibition is still to take place, the photographic work produced has the potential to be a tool for raising awareness, promoting dialogue, and advocating for change (Wang & Burris, 1997). The exhibition will thus bridge the gap between learners and decision makers. This study thus improves on previous studies in secondary schools, as it provides a means to transform psychological research into social and political action.

This study also successfully expanded on previous literature, as it provided an important new insight— It is not only personal attitudes and structural factors that maintain coloniality in historically white schools, but also the collective culture of the South African ex model-C school itself. The way in which implicit cultural practices dating back to colonial times are used to silence black individuals in historically white schools is an idea that has been neglected in previous studies. This theme should be investigated in more depth in the future so as to ascertain how it could be problematised and ultimately dismantled.

In addition to the insights gained, the findings may provide schools with some direction on where to go from here in conceptualizing what a decolonised school would be like.

Looking Towards a Decolonial Future

Through discussion, the participants gave various suggestions of how schools could be transformed into more inclusive spaces. Although they were in agreement that there is a need for increased physical diversity within the school’s population, they believed that racial contact alone was not enough for meaningful transformation—a notion that is supported by other research in schools (Sayed, 1999; Soudien, 2007; Vandeyar, 2008). The learners identified a need for transformation on both a psychological and a structural level.

One suggestion was to implement regular de-briefing sections within each grade where learners could express their concerns and engage directly with school management. The participants also suggested that the curriculum for compulsory life orientation classes could be transformed to bring issues of race, transformation and decolonisation into classrooms on a permanent basis. Doing this may stimulate dialogue and promote awareness about these issues.

The participants also saw it necessary to change the idea of what a learner from an ex model-C school should be like. Instead of focusing on superficial image, schools should be raising learners who care about equality and resist all forms of racism. However, since the cultural institution is often entrenched in learners by the time they are in high school, the participants felt that the process should start earlier on, in the preparatory school. This would entail better communication and collaboration between primary and secondary schools.

The suggestion of shifting the focus from secondary education to primary education is one that should be investigated in future research. Qualitative research efforts should also focus on schooling contexts different to the one discussed in this report, as the participants' school is just one example of an historically white institution in which race and coloniality interact with daily, lived realities. More insights into similar institutions, at all levels of education, are necessary for addressing South Africa's complex past, and moving forward into the future.

Endnotes

¹ I use black here in the inclusive sense of the word to refer to all racial groups who were disadvantaged by apartheid. The term was adopted to resist the essentialist categorization imposed by the apartheid government and to indicate a sense of solidarity between all of those who were, and continue to be, oppressed (Kessi & Cornell, 2015).

² The school provided these statistics upon request.

References

- Baez, B. (2000). Agency, structure and power: An inquiry into racism and resistance for education. *Studies in Philosophy and Education, 19*, 329-348. doi: 10.1023/A:1005241732091
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology, 3*(2), 77-101. doi: 10.1191/1478088706qp063oa
- Brydon-Miller, M. (1997). Participatory action research: Psychology and social change. *Journal of Social Issues, 53*(4), 657-666. doi: 10.1111/j.1540-4560.1997.tb02454.x

- Carrim, N., & Soudien, C. (1999). Critical antiracism in South Africa. In S. May (Ed.), *Critical multiculturalism: Rethinking multicultural and antiracist education*, 153-171. London, England: Falmer Press
- Cornell, J., Ratele, K., & Kessi, S. (2016). Race, gender and sexuality in student experiences of violence and resistances on a university campus. *Perspectives in Education*, 34(2), 97-119. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.18820/2519593X/pie.v34i2.8>
- Cornell, J., & Kessi, S. (2016). Black students' experiences of transformation at a previously "white only" South African university: a photovoice study. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 1-18. doi: 10.1080/01419870.2016.1206586
- Dolby, N. (2002). Making white: Constructing race in a South African high school. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 32(1), 7-29. doi: 10.1111/1467-873X.00213
- Fanon, F. (1967). *Black Skin, White Masks*. New York: Grove press.
- Hook, D. (2004b). Frantz Fanon, Steve Biko, 'psychopolitics' and critical psychology. In D. Hook (Ed.), *Critical psychology* (pp. 84-113). Cape Town, South Africa: UCT Press.
- Hook, D. (2005). A critical psychology of the postcolonial. *Theory & Psychology*, 15(4), 475-503. doi: 10.1177/0959354305054748
- Howarth, C. (2002). Using the theory of social representations to explore difference in the research relationship. *Qualitative Research*, 2(1), 21-33. doi: 10.1177/1468794102002001637
- Howarth, C. (2004). Re-presentation and resistance in the context of school exclusion: reasons to be critical. *Journal of community & applied social psychology*, 14(5), 356-377. doi: 10.1002/casp.798
- Kessi, S. (2011). Photovoice as a practice of re-presentation and social solidarity: Experiences from a youth empowerment project in Dar es Salaam and Soweto. *Papers on social representations*, 20(7), 1-27. ISSN: 1021-5573
- Kessi, S. (2013). Re-politicizing race in community development: Using postcolonial psychology and Photovoice methods for social change. *Psychology in Society*, (45), 19-35. Retrieved from: http://www.scielo.org.za/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S1015-60462013000200003&lng=en&tlng=es.
- Kessi, S., & Cornell, J. (2015). Coming to UCT: Black students, transformation and discourses of race. *Journal of Student Affairs in Africa*, 3(2), 1-16. doi: 10.14426/jsaa.v3i2.132

- MacLeod, C., Bhatia, S., & Kessi, S. (2017). Postcolonialism and Psychology: Growing interest, promising potential. In Stainton-Rogers, W. & Willig, C. *SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research in Psychology: Second edition*. London: SAGE.
- McKinney, C. (2007). 'If I speak English, does it make me less black anyway?' 'Race' and English in South African desegregated schools. *English Academy Review*, 24(2), 6-24. doi: 10.1080/10131750701452253
- McKinney, C. (2010). Schooling in black and white: Assimilationist discourses and subversive identity performances in a desegregated South African girls' school. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 13(2), 191-207. doi: 10.1080/13613321003726876
- McKinney, C. (2011). Asymmetrical relations of knowing: Pedagogy, discourse and identity in a de (re) segregated girls' school. *Journal of Education*, 51, 1-23.
- McKinney, C. (2013). Orientations to English in post-apartheid schooling. *English Today*, 29(01), 22-27. doi: 10.1017/S0266078412000491
- Langa, M. (2010). Contested multiple voices of young masculinities amongst adolescent boys in Alexandra Township, South Africa. *Journal of child and adolescent mental health*, 22(1), 1-13. doi: 10.2989/17280583.2010.493654
- Pather, R. (2016, August 29). Pretoria Girls High School pupil: I was instructed to fix myself as if I was broken. *Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved from: <https://mg.co.za/article/2016-08-29-pretoria-girls-high-school-pupil-i-was-instructed-to-fix-myself-as-if-i-was-broken>
- Phoenix, A. (2009). De-colonising practices: negotiating narratives from racialised and gendered experiences of education. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 12(1), 101-114. doi:10.1080/13613320802651053
- Sayed, Y. (1999). Discourses of the policy of educational decentralisation in South Africa since 1994: An examination of the South African Schools Act [1][2]. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 29(2), 141-152. doi: 10.1080/0305792990290204
- Staff Reporter. (2016, September 1). Sans Souci Girls' High School pupils protest against 'discriminatory' code of conduct. *Mail & Guardian*. Retrieved from: <https://mg.co.za/article/2016-09-01-sans-souci-girls-high-school-pupils-protest-against-discriminatory-code-of-conduct>
- Soudien, C. (2007). The asymmetries of contact: An assessment of 30 years of school integration in South Africa. *Race Ethnicity and Education*, 10(4), 439-456. doi: 10.1080/13613320701658464

- Soudien, C. (2010). The reconstitution of privilege: Integration in former white schools in South Africa. *Journal of Social Issues, 66*(2), 352-366. doi:10.1111/j.1540-4560.2010.01649.x
- Suffla, S., Kaminer, D., & Bawa, U. (2012). Photovoice as community engaged research: The interplay between knowledge creation and agency in a South African study on safety promotion. *Journal of Psychology in Africa, 22*(4), 517-526. doi:10.1080/14330237.2012.10820563
- Tatum, D. (1997). *“Why Are All the Black Kids Sitting Together in the Cafeteria?”* New York: Basic Books.
- Vandeyar, S. (2008). Shifting selves: The emergence of new identities in South African schools. *International Journal of Educational Development, 28*(3), 286-299. doi: 10.1016/j.ijedudev.2007.05.001
- Wang, C., & Burris, M. A. (1997). Photovoice: Concept, methodology, and use for participatory needs assessment. *Health education & behavior, 24*(3), 369-387. doi: 10.1177/109019819702400309
- Wang, C. C., & Redwood-Jones, Y. A. (2001). Photovoice ethics: Perspectives from Flint photovoice. *Health Education & Behavior, 28*(5), 560-572. doi: 10.1177/109019810102800504
- Wang, C. C. (2006). Youth participation in photovoice as a strategy for community change. *Journal of community practice, 14*(1-2), 147-161. doi: 10.1300/J125v14n01_09
- Zuma, B. (2010). The social psychology of (de)segregation. Rigorously studied and poorly conceptualized. *Psychology & Society, 3, 92, 106.*
- Zway, M., & Boonzaier, F. (2015). “I believe that being a lesbian is not a curse”: Young black lesbian women representing their identities through photovoice. *Agenda, 29*(1), 96-107. doi: 10.1080/10130950.2015.1013784

Appendix A- Informed Consent and Parental Consent Form

**Department of Psychology
University of Cape Town**



A Photovoice Study on Black Pupils' Experiences at ex Model-C Schools

— Consent Form —

You are invited to take part in a study that seeks to explore the experiences of Black pupils at historically and predominantly white institutions. We hope that this study will shed light on what transformation efforts can be made in education in order to make schools more inclusive places. Participation is entirely voluntary.

Procedures

Participation in this study will entail the following:

- Participation in 3 focus group sessions with peers from your school, where we will be discussing your own personal experiences as a Black pupil at a historically white school. Each focus group will be on a weekday after school hours and will be audio-recorded so they can be transcribed later on. The first one will be an hour long, and the second and third ones 45 minutes each.
- A workshop that will entail learning how to use cameras to tell a story, and a discussion of issues related to photography ethics and safety.
- You taking photographs to represent your experience as a Black student at a historically white school, and assembling these photographs into a photo-story. You will be given cameras, and two weeks in which to do this.
- An exhibition in which you may voluntarily participate to display your work to people in the school community.
- An hour-long debriefing meeting after the exhibition in which we discuss your experience of the process.

Risks and Additional Burdens

This research is being done separately from the school and will in no way affect your school performance. It will be carried out in the third term when you do not have exams so as not to place too much of a burden of you academically. If however you wish to drop out of the study, you may do so at any time with no disadvantage to yourself. If you find any part of this project distressing, we will help you take the necessary steps to get supportive counseling. There will be no financial cost to you to partake in this study and any extra costs due to transport, etc. will be compensated for.

Benefits

By taking part in this study you will receive free photography training, the chance to exhibit your photographs in a public forum, have your voice heard by members of the school community and participate in important and current conversations about transformation. Although we will ask you to give consent for your photographs to be used in a final research report, you will exclusively own the rights to your own work.

Privacy and Confidentiality

Your information and audio recordings will be kept securely at the University of Cape Town and no other parties will have access to them. Your identity will be protected in the final research report using pseudonyms. If you wish to participate in the exhibition but want to remain anonymous, we will make provisions for this as well.

We are not able to ensure that other members in the focus group will not share what you say outside the focus group, but we will make all efforts to encourage an environment of mutual respect and solidarity to minimize this risk.

Contact Details

If you have any concerns or questions, you can contact either:

Sarah Kew-Simpson: 076 262 0947

kwssar001@myuct.ac.za

Dr Shose Kessi: 021 650 4606

shose.kessi@uct.ac.za

If you have any issues regarding this research or your questions about rights as a research participant, please contact Mrs Rosalind Adams on 021 650 3417.

If you understand all the above procedures, risks and benefits and you would like to participate in this study, please sign below:

Participant Name: _____

Participant Signature: _____

Date: _____

Focus Group Consent

I, _____ agree to having my voice audio-recorded in focus group discussions.

Participant Signature: _____

Parental/Guardian Consent

I, _____ (parent/guardian) of _____ have read the above procedures, benefits and risks and consent to my child participating in this study.

Parent/Guardian signature: _____

Appendix B: Focus Group 1 Schedule

- Collect signed consent forms
- Introductions and ground rules
- Possible prompts for conversation:
 - What are some things that come to mind when I say the word “racism”?
 - Where does racism happen in schools and why?
 - An ex-Model C school is a public school, like yours, that was previously for white pupils only. How effective do you think transformation has been in these schools?
 - Discussion of recent racist incidents at ex-model C schools that have been in

the news

- Could you speak about some of your personal experiences of being a black pupil in a majority white school?
- What do you enjoy about your schooling experience?
- Which parts of your experience as a black pupil at this school do you find concerning?

Appendix C: Focus Group 2 +3 Schedule

- Presentation of photo-stories
- Prompts for discussion about each story:
 - From the photographer:
 - What is happening in the picture?
 - Why did you take this picture?
 - From the group: (ask to respectfully comment on each other's photos)
 - How does this picture relate to your lives?

- Why does this issue occur?
 - What can you do to address this issue?
- After presentations of stories:
 - What main themes are present across these photo-stories?
 - How could these issues be dealt with?
 - Who do you need to reach in order to get these issues dealt with? What action would need to be taken?

Appendix D: List of Photographs and Photographers

Photograph 1:	Yondipha
Photograph 2:	Hlonela
Photograph 3:	Yondipha
Photograph 4:	Yondipha
Photograph 5:	Josquin
Photograph 6:	Josquin
Photograph 7:	Josquin
Photo-series 1:	Ansaar

Photo-series 2: Ansaar
Photo-series 3: Chumani
Photo-series 4: Ansaar
Photo-series 5: Ansaar
Photo-series 6: Ansaar
Photo-series 7: Seth
Photo-series 8: Ansaar