"We are earning peanuts": Precarious Work and Fatherhood Among South African Car Guards

Katya Kee-Tui and Tanian Walsh

Department of Psychology, University of Cape Town

PSY4025W: Research Methods

Supervisor: Dr. Mandisa Malinga

27 October 2022

Word count: 9949

PLAGIARISM DECLARATION

PLAGIARISM

This means that you present substantial portions or elements of another's work, ideas or data as your own, even if the original author is cited occasionally. A signed photocopy or other copy of the Declaration below must accompany every piece of work that you hand in.

DECLARATION

1. I know that Plagiarism is wrong. Plagiarism is to use another's work and pretend that it is one's own.

2. I have used the American Psychological Association formatting for citation and referencing. Each significant contribution to, and quotation in, this essay/report/project from the work or works, of other people has been attributed, cited and referenced.

3. This essay/report/project is my own work.

4. I have not allowed, and will not allow anyone to copy my work with the intention of passing it off as his or her own work.

NAME: Katya Kee-Tui, Tanian Walsh

SIGNATURE: 

STUDENT NUMBER: KTXKAT002, WLSTAN004

SUPERVISOR'S NAME: Dr. Mandisa Malinga

Abstract

This study examined the correlation between fatherhood and precarious work among car guards in Cape Town, South Africa. Among the study's objectives was to examine how working as a car guard shapes men's definition of fatherhood, as well as how it affects their ability to be active fathers. This thesis is an extension of a study conducted in 2018, thus uses secondary data in the form of nine semi-structured face-to-face interviews. Thematic analysis revealed that the participating men associate fatherhood with masculinity and, as such, echo traditional South African gender roles which view fathers as financial providers. The participating fathers strive to fulfil these expectations by taking on precarious labour, which is often the only available option due to structural factors within South Africa, such as high unemployment rates. Ironically, however, car guarding limits men's ability to participate in the financial – and emotional – aspects of their children's lives.

Keywords: fatherhood, precarious work, masculinity, breadwinner

Word count: 154

Acknowledgements

We would first and foremost like to thank the participants, without whom this research would not be possible.

We would like to express our gratitude to our supervisor, Dr. Mandisa Malinga, for assisting and guiding us, as well as sharing her knowledge with us throughout this process.

We would also like to thank our families who loved and supported us throughout this process. And, finally, to thank each other for the hard work, partnership and friendship.

Contents

"We are earning peanuts": Precarious Work and Fatherhood Among South African Car Guards

There is a growing interest in the role of fatherhood as policies in South Africa call for an increase in paternal involvement (Ratele, 2021). Fatherhood is the combination of the father's physical, emotional and financial involvement in his child's life (Nelson, 2004; Ratele, 2021). However, many cultures ignore this diverse nature, and view fathers primarily as breadwinners within the family (Chauke & Khunou, 2014; Chili & Maharaj, 2015; Lesch et al., 2021). A host of structural factors in South Africa, including a high unemployment rate and lack of adequate jobs, hinder men's ability to assume the idealised breadwinner role (Foster et al., 2021). As such, fathers often have no choice but to take on precarious work, such as car guarding, to support their families. Precarious work is uncertain, has unpredictable hours and offers little to no income (Standing, 2014), making it difficult for fathers in this industry to meet society's financial expectations (Foster et al., 2021; Malinga, 2021). It is, therefore, important to engage in conversations about alternative ways in which fathers can participate in their children's lives, and to eradicate the conception that paternal success can only be achieved by providing financially.

This study seeks to understand how car guards in South Africa approach their roles as fathers, and how their work shapes their experiences of fatherhood. It will also explore whether, as found in other studies, fathers disengage from their families when unable to support them (Malinga, 2021), or if they find alternative ways to be involved in their children's lives (le Roux & Lesch, 2022). To achieve these aims, we will use secondary data, specifically interviews conducted in 2018 as part of a larger study exploring the interaction between precarious work and fatherhood among car guards, waiters and university lecturers. However, this study will focus on car guards as there is limited research on this group. This paper begins with a review of existing literature regarding car guards and fatherhood in South

Africa, followed by a discussion of the paper's aims, objectives and methods. The analysis will then discuss the five themes that emerged from the data, namely *Defining Fatherhood and Fathering Practices, The Nature of Car Guarding in Cape Town, Structural Factors that Impact Fathers and Car Guards in South Africa, Barriers That Limit Fathers' Participation,* and *The "New Father" Among Car Guards.* The data revealed that car guarding is a form of precarious employment that fathers pursue to fulfil their breadwinner role, and yet it limits their ability to fulfil nurturing obligations in the family.

Literature Review

Society's expectation of men to uphold the traditional breadwinner role (Arnold & Bongiovi, 2013; Chauke & Khunou, 2014) is not viable for many in South Africa, owing to the country's high unemployment rate, a lack of quality, equitable education and a steep decline in formal job vacancies (Foster et al., 2021; Statistics South Africa, 2021). As such, many fathers adopt precarious work to fulfil their financial duties (Mosoetsa et al., 2016). Past literature has discussed the experiences of precarious workers generally (Campbell & Price, 2016; Kalleberg, 2012), but few have explored how precarious work impacts experiences of fatherhood.

While fathers engage in precarious work to fulfil their financial obligations, the low wages and economic instability associated with their work often mean they are not able to achieve their financial aims (Mosoetsa et al., 2016). Yet fathers who opt to take on caring roles at home instead are often scrutinised for not trying to earn a living (Malinga, 2021). Moreover, factors such as migration, the limited income generated by car guarding and the long working hours, limit fathers' abilities to be involved in caring masculinities (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022). Thus, more research is needed to specifically examine car guards' experiences of fatherhood. The following sections will draw links between fatherhood,

masculinity and precarious work to illustrate the impact on South African car guards' experiences.

Fatherhood and Masculinity

A father is defined as being the child's biological parent, whereas fatherhood refers to a father's active role in his children's lives (Koenig-Visagie & van Eeden, 2013; Scheibling, 2018). Parenting involves the combination of being physically, financially and emotionally present in a child's life (Ratele, 2021). However, the longstanding belief in South Africa is that mothers should assume the caring roles while fathers fulfil the financial responsibilities, reflecting hegemonic masculinity (Koenig-Visagie & van Eeden, 2013).

Hegemonic masculinity is the dominant conceptualisation of what it means to be "manly" (Jewkes et al., 2015). Fathers may achieve masculine validation through their ability to provide for their families (Chili & Maharaj, 2015; Koenig-Visagie & van Eeden, 2013). Failure to be successful financial providers results in men having low self-esteem and potentially feeling emasculated (Chauke & Khunou, 2014; Koenig-Visagie & van Eeden, 2013). Due to long working hours and/or migrating for work, efforts to meet financial expectations also inhibit men from participating beyond the financial dimension of fatherhood (Scheibling, 2018). The following section will explore how men's financial obligations impact their ability to be present fathers. A 21st-century phenomenon known as the "new father" will be introduced, in which fathers are encouraged to take on financial and caring responsibilities.

Financial Obligations

The media, literature, and fathers themselves, place more importance on the financial rather than emotional component of fatherhood (Blount & Cunningham, 2014; Chauke & Khunou, 2014). For instance, the media, through film, images, advertisement and discourse, defines fatherhood through traditional notions of masculinity that perpetuate the idea that

men are financial providers (Chauke & Khunou, 2014; Gregory & Milner, 2011). Men adopt these societal expectations, the effects of which can be seen in Malinga's (2021) study of day labourers where some of the participants felt humiliated for not supporting their families financially and, as a result, disengaged from them. Sikweyiya et al. (2017) found that many low-income men – men that earn between R1 and R19200 annually (Census, 2011) – are dedicated to fulfilling their stereotypical breadwinner role. As such, they are forced to engage in jobs such as car guarding which limit the time they can spend with their children. Eradicating these stereotypical roles might encourage fathers to navigate other fatherly roles and embody the "new father" phenomenon.

The "New Father"

Traditional literature posits that fathers should secure employment to fulfil their financial responsibilities (Jayachandran, 2021), while current literature argues that men should adjust their fathering roles to be more involved in their children's lives (Enderstein & Boonzaier, 2013; Pruett et al., 2017). The integrated approach is represented by modern fathers who are redefining heteronormative views of fatherhood and engaging in emotional support within their families (Gregory & Milner, 2011; Johansson, 2011), including unpaid labour at home and spending quality time with their children (Enderstein & Boonzaier, 2013; Mvune & Bhana, 2022).

The "new father" is a man who wants to be both a nurturer and a financial provider, merging traditional expectations with caring masculinities (Gregory & Milner, 2011; Mvune & Bhana, 2022). The "new father" phenomenon may influence low-income, precariously employed South African fathers and encourage them to remain present in their children's lives when unable to financially provide (Nelson, 2004). Care must, however, be taken to acknowledge the necessity for financial provision, while understanding that not all fathers,

especially those from impoverished backgrounds, have the luxury of participating in both emotional and financial aspects.

Precarious Work

According to Guy Standing (2014) and others (Campbell & Price, 2016; Rubery et al., 2018), precarious work involves unpredictable hours, low wages and job insecurity. Precarious work is perceived as normal, ordinary and commonplace within the Global South (Mosoetsa et al., 2016; Munck et al., 2020), reflecting the situation in South Africa where precarious work is widespread due to high unemployment rates. In 2021, South Africa's unemployment rate was 34.4%, whereby 38.2% of black Africans were unemployed (Statistics South Africa, 2021). These high unemployment rates, paired with more competitive formal employment, have forced more black African men into precarious work (Munck et al., 2020). Precarious work now accounts for 31.7% of the country's total employment (Statistics South Africa, 2021), the rise of which can be dated back to the apartheid era (Lesch & Kelapile, 2016).

During apartheid, many black men were compelled to join the migrant labour system to find work (Salami & Okeke, 2018), moving from rural to urban areas and often leaving their families behind (Lesch & Kelapile, 2016; Salami & Okeke, 2018). Black men were marginalised and today live in deprived socioeconomic environments (le Roux & Lesch, 2022). The difficulty for South African fathers to find viable work causes them to turn to precarious work like car guarding (Lesch & Kelapile, 2016; Salami & Okeke, 2018).

Car Guarding in South Africa

Car guarding is an unregulated precarious job which involves guarding motorists' vehicles (Foster et al., 2021; Munck et al., 2020; Steyn, 2018). Its prevalence in South Africa is due in part to the shortage of formal employment, forcing many local and migrant men into car guarding as they have no alternative job opportunities (Arnold & Bongiovi, 2013; Blaauw

& Pretorius, 2022; Foster et al., 2021), as well as a rise in the crime rate whereby Foster et al. (2021) identified car guarding as an effective measure to reduce crime in South Africa.

Formal car guards work for agencies who usually demand payment for an allocated parking bay area, such as parking lots in shopping centres, whereas informal car guards move from place to place, guarding vehicles parked along the street (Coetzee et al., 2015). In both scenarios, car guards are forced to rely on unpredictable tips (Foster et al., 2021), which calls into question whether this job is even work in the traditional sense (Coetzee et al., 2015). Self-employed car guards are at particular risk of struggling to fulfil financial expectations and earn a livable wage due to the lack of a salary and no formal employment contracts (Coetzee et al., 2015; Rubery et al., 2018). Furthermore, Foster et al. (2021) highlighted that it is becoming increasingly difficult to make a sustainable living from car guarding due to the increase in automated boom gates and the reduction in employment since the Covid-19 outbreak. Despite this, car guarding continues to grow and affect local and migrant workers.

Significantly, many car guards are migrant workers who left their families in search of employment. Car guarding is not their first choice of employment; however, they are forced to enter it due to a lack of formal job vacancies and a necessity to earn an income (Foster et al., 2021). They generally migrate regionally from neighbouring African countries, or internally from other South African cities (Foster et al., 2021). Migration means men are physically unable to spend time with and engage in nurturing activities with their children (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Malinga, 2021). Additionally, migration affects the relationship between car guards and their partners, often leading to separation or divorce due to the distance (Foster & Chasomeris, 2017). Therefore, a commitment to fulfil financial obligations often impacts and hinders migrant car guards' engagement with caring masculinities (Enderstein & Boonzaier, 2013; Malinga & Ratele, 2022). Ironically, they are not guaranteed to fulfil these financial expectations either due to the economic uncertainty of

the work (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Foster & Chasomeris, 2017; Malinga, 2021). As such, their economic instability might cause stress at home as they struggle to support their families, thus it is important to understand how car guarding shapes experiences of fatherhood (le Roux & Lesch, 2022).

Fatherhood and Precarious Work

While the interaction between fatherhood and precarious work has been explored, further research on fatherhood specifically among car guards is needed (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022). Despite the emergence of the "new father" phenomenon, the traditional view of fathers as primary breadwinners is still prevalent. The expectations of this role may cause additional stress for low-income men in precarious work (le Roux & Lesch, 2022; Makusha et al., 2021; Malinga & Ratele, 2022) as they are often the household's sole income earners (Munck et al., 2020; Mvune & Bhana, 2022).

Past studies saw car guards expressing concern about sending money home (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022) and justifying their long working hours as it allowed them to provide for their families. While there is a growing acknowledgment that fathers should be more than merely financial providers (Enderstein & Boonzaier, 2013), precarious work creates barriers which prevents them from spending quality time with their children (Malinga, 2016) or participating in caring masculinities (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Steyn, 2018).

These barriers, including long working hours and migration, are exacerbated by societal and cultural expectations, whereby dominant cultures within South African dictate that caring work is a woman's job, and men are often ridiculed for doing it (le Roux & Lesch, 2022). As stress builds, stemming in part from the shame and emasculation of being unable to fulfil the breadwinner stereotype (Malinga, 2021), some men disengage from caring labour to regain a sense of masculinity, or even resort to domestic violence (Boonzaier, 2018; Field et al., 2018). Their personal humiliation may be compounded by other men mocking their

inability to financially provide and, more so, for participating in perceived feminine care work (Heinz et al., 2021; le Roux & Lesch, 2022). Violence is a way of asserting their dominance and manhood – once more fitting into the confines of heteronormative masculinity (Malinga & Ratele, 2022; Morrell et al., 2012; Valiquette-Tessier et al., 2019).

The barriers to the "new father" phenomenon echo LaRossa's (1988) work on the culture versus conduct debate, where "culture" refers to the shifting beliefs of what constitutes fatherhood and "conduct" refers to the paternal practises in which fathers choose to engage. While LaRossa (1988) also found that the culture of fatherhood is changing as parenting roles become more androgynous, equal parenting roles are not often seen in low-income families where various challenges prevent men from becoming more involved (Pruett et al., 2017). Thus, there is a complicated divide between what men wish to do as fathers, versus what they can do (LaRossa, 2007).

Although caring masculinities may be positioned as a way for low-income, precariously employed men to remain involved in their children's lives, they face many barriers. The introduction of caring masculinities requires more research in order to permeate society and allow men to meet their fatherly, as well as cultural, expectations, thus allowing them to take pride in caring work (Heinz et al., 2021). This transformation of perceptions pertaining to fatherhood should be investigated by scholars and represented in the media, schools, workplaces and general discourse in society (Heinz et al., 2021). Increasing knowledge on the meaning and practice of fatherhood in South Africa may eradicate the narrow, one-dimensional view of fathers as financial providers.

Aims and Objectives

The first objective of this study is to gain insight into the lived experiences of fathers and car guards in South Africa, a sector previously neglected in literature (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022), and explore how local and migrant car guards in South Africa understand

their role as fathers. The second objective is to understand how being both a precarious worker and a father affects men's ability to 'do' fatherhood and how this is influenced by formal or informal employment. This will create a greater understanding of how car guards define and practice fatherhood. To meet these objectives, the following research questions will be asked.

Main Research Question:

- How do South African car guards define, practice and experience fatherhood?

Sub-questions:

- How does car guarding influence men's understanding and practice of fatherhood?
- Are there differences between the experiences of local and migrant car guards?
- What are the differences between formally employed and self-employed car guards?

Theoretical Framework

The data will be viewed through the lens of Connell and Messerschmidt's (2005) theory of hegemonic masculinity which focuses on dominant narratives of masculinities and how they interact with social, gender and power relations (Jewkes et al., 2015). The theory acknowledges how heteronormative norms have become ingrained in society and help maintain gendered stereotypes (Morrell et al., 2012), thus influencing men to behave in a more masculine fashion (Connell & Messerschmidt, 2005).

Within South Africa, hegemonic masculinity is displayed through a patriarchal lens, whereby men are predominantly financial providers and not involved in the nurturing aspects of childrearing (Enderstein & Boonzaier, 2013; Ochsner, 2012). Thus, hegemonic masculinity and the socio-cultural context within South Africa may limit men's ability to be more involved, even if they wished to be (Arnold & Bongiovi, 2013; Valiquette-Tessier et al., 2019). For this study, the ideology of hegemonic masculinity will be used to analyse

whether the participating men reflect these ideals, as well as help us understand how men see their roles as fathers and how they engage in fathering activities.

Method

Research Design

This study used a qualitative design that involves the study of participants in their natural setting, in the hopes of gaining an in-depth understanding of their experiences and context (Black, 1994; Green & Thorogood, 2018). The qualitative design is primarily focused on how participants make sense of their lives and allows researchers to understand human experiences that cannot be expressed by statistics alone.

Additionally, this study used a phenomenological approach to describe the participants' lived experiences of precarious work and fatherhood (Creswell, 2013). The phenomenological approach prevents universalising experiences by using participants' personal accounts and the meanings they attach to them (Creswell, 2013; Norlyk & Harder, 2010). These approaches are appropriate for this study because they aim to help us understand how men view and practice fatherhood, and how car guarding impacts their practices and understanding.

Participants and Sampling

This study used secondary data, specifically interviews conducted with car guards in South Africa in 2018. The inclusion criteria for the original project was that participants be self-defined fathers and precariously employed as either a car guard, waiter or lecturer. However, this study focuses exclusively on car guarding, due to its prevalence in South Africa and the lack of literature on this sector (Coetzee et al., 2015; Foster et al., 2021).

A total of 20 interviews were conducted with participants purposively sampled to meet the two criteria of being fathers and car guards. Purposive sampling involves the researcher deliberately selecting people who have experienced the phenomenon of interest

(Farrugia, 2019). A ‘walkabout’ was carried out along parking facilities in Cape Town to recruit participants for the study.

The interviews were conducted in either isiXhosa, Afrikaans or English, depending on each participant’s preferred language. These specific languages were selected as the interviewer was fluent in them, and they fall within the 11 official South African languages. The ten (10) English interviews were selected for analysis in this study, as English is our native tongue and there was no budget for a translator; the number of interviews is also recommended due to the size and time limitations of an Honours research project. Upon transcription, one interview was identified as being with a construction worker (not a car guard) and was therefore excluded from this project, leaving nine interviews for analysis.

Data Collection

Data was collected in 2018 using individual semi-structured face-to-face interviews led by an interview guide (see Appendix A). A combination of the aims of the study and literature on the topic were used as the foundation for the interview guide. Semi-structured interviews allow participants to describe their experiences in their own words (le Roux & Lesch, 2022; Yanow & Schwartz-Shea, 2015). This approach is important as it prioritises participants’ voices with regards to their experiences of fatherhood and precarious work. Additionally, semi-structured interviews rely on an interview guide which ensures that the responses are relevant to the overall research question. However, the interviewer is not constrained by the interview guide; they may ask relevant follow up questions to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the participant’s experience (Blee & Taylor, 2002). This allows the participants to elaborate on how the phenomenon of interest influences them (Yanow & Schwartz-Shea, 2015).

The interviews were audio-recorded and lasted between 10-20 minutes. Participants were interviewed close to their place of work to ensure their work was not disrupted.

Interviews with the informal car guards were conducted along the street on which they were working, while formal car guards were interviewed in shopping centres and university car parks. The interviews were often interrupted or ended abruptly as the car guards had to attend to their work (Coetzee et al., 2015).

Data Analysis

Thematic analysis was used to analyse the interview transcripts, a method which helps the study achieve its goal of ensuring that participants' (car guards in this case) voices are heard and allows people to understand car guards' experiences of fatherhood. This, in turn, informs how we think about interventions on fatherhood. This paper used Braun and Clarke's (2006) six step thematic analysis to analyse the data. Thus, we first familiarised ourselves with the data by transcribing the audio recordings. After immersing ourselves in the audio recordings and transcriptions, we identified codes to group and organise the data. Coding allowed us to find recurring topics that eventually resulted in the identification of five main themes that relate to car guards' experiences of fatherhood. These five themes were given names that stayed true to the participants' sentiments and they are unpacked in the analysis section of this study.

More specifically, an inductive, data-driven thematic analysis was used (Nowell et al., 2017), allowing the data to speak for itself without being forced to meet the researcher's preconceived ideas or fit into the confines of existing theories (Braun & Clarke, 2006). Furthermore, thematic analysis is considered compatible with phenomenology through its focus on subjective experiences (Sundler et al., 2019). Thematic analysis allows the data to be analysed in terms of recurring themes and experiences which can then be used to inform future studies on masculinity, fatherhood and car guards. An analysis of themes enabled the researchers to provide a rich account of what it means to be a car guard and a father.

Ethical Considerations

The Psychology Department's Ethical Review Committee at the University of Cape Town granted ethical clearance for the original study (see Appendix B). Thereafter, invitations to participate in the study were circulated through a walkabout (see Appendix C). Among the ethical considerations in this study were informed consent, confidentiality and voluntary participation. Informed consent refers to providing participants with enough information to make a rational decision before participating in the study (Connelly, 2014). To uphold this, each participant was asked to complete a consent form (see Appendix D) that explained the study in which they were participating, as well as its aims and any potential risks or benefits for the participant. To honour the ethical requirement of voluntary participation, participants could withdraw from the study at any time without risking negative consequences. To preserve the participants' anonymity, only those directly analysing the data were privy to the interviews. The audio-recordings and transcripts are on a password-protected flash drive and all write ups include pseudonyms in place of the participants' real names.

Analysis and Discussion

This study sought to investigate how car guards understand and navigate their way through fatherhood. An analysis of the data uncovered five themes, namely *Defining Fatherhood and Fathering Practices, The Nature of Car Guarding in Cape Town, Structural Factors that Impact Fathers and Car Guards in South Africa, Barriers That Limit Fathers' Participation,* and *The "New Father" Among Car Guards.* These themes aim to convey the participants' experiences of fatherhood and car guarding, which will contribute to current conceptualisations of precarious work and fatherhood. Existing literature on this topic will be integrated into the discussion to identify how participants' experiences fit into broader research. The following sections will unpack these themes in the order presented above. Pseudonyms have been used to protect the participants' identities. Please refer to Appendix E

for the participants' demographic information. Participants ranged from 25 to 39 years old. Two participants were from Cape Town, three were local migrants and three international migrants. Four participants were formally employed, and five were self-employed. The participants had two children each, except for Thandiwe and Ahadi who had three and one child respectively.

Defining Fatherhood and Fathering Practices

This theme will highlight the participants' perceptions of fatherhood, the benefits and challenges thereof, their involvement in their children's lives and the interplay between fatherhood and car guarding. Scheibling (2018) defines fatherhood as the father's physical, economic, *and* emotional involvement in their child's life. Akida (age 25) expressed that fatherhood is *"very hard"*, whereas the other participating fathers defined fatherhood as a responsibility that is both challenging and rewarding:

> *Mhmm being a father, it is also challenging because you know whatever you get, you have someone to look after you understand?* (Themba, 34)

> *... it's just like uh responsibility man. For me it is like to stay out of trouble, stay out of prison. That's the way I see it.* (Adam, 38)

> *… for me fatherhood is all about achievement because you achieve, you're testing yourself to the physical limits, you know, are you really, like, prepared to take on responsibility?* (Peter, 32)

Adam's understanding of fatherhood as a responsibility to *"stay out of trouble"* is echoed by other participants who defined fatherhood as a responsibility to set a good example for their children:

> *That's also the thing I love because I can also teach my younger generation, I can teach them from the mistakes I've made in the past, you know what I'm saying?* (Peter)

> *I'm … a father and, and I have responsibility. It's good because a lot of people, they don't have responsibility, don't have nothing because you don't think about another, you see, because with me, … I can't be that because I know I have to respect myself because I have children because if I do bad things, how, what am I teaching for my, for my children?* (Ahadi, 37)

There were also participants who associated fatherhood with masculinity, saying *"you feel yourself ya, as a real man, because having no kids man, like having no challenges, like you feel like you are a dead man walking"* (Themba). Fatherhood and masculinity are fluid concepts, but certain ideals still overshadow this fluidity, such as the perception that fatherhood is a vital indicator of achieving manhood (Koenig-Visage & van Eeden, 2013). The following quote aligns with hegemonic perceptions of masculinity (Jewkes et al., 2015):

> *Every man have to be father. It's a must! You have to be a father; you have to have family.* (Ahadi)

Ahadi's response reflects traditional gender roles. Despite the popular belief that fathers are financial providers, the participants try to be involved in other aspects of their children's lives too. Their involvement played a salient role in how they described their relationship with their children, which will be unpacked in the following section.

Relationship With Children

Of the nine participants, seven associated a good parent-child relationship with quality time and communicating with their children. Their responses, below, reflect the "new father" phenomenon, where fathers are eradicating traditional fatherly roles that focus

solely on financial provision by increasing their emotional or physical presence (Enderstein & Boonzaier, 2013; Johansson, 2011; Pruett et al., 2017):

> *You need to have … the time to play with them.* (Thandiwe, 39)

> *Eh, my relationship with my children I think we be having a good relationship cause uh I, I know my children and I spend some time knowing them more…* (Elijah, 27)

Although these participants reflected on getting to know their children and spending quality time with them, two participants alluded to their expected breadwinner role as a significant determinant of the kind of relationship they have with their children:

> *I have got a good relationship with them because I can manage to buy them stuff whenever they want.* (Themba)

> *Whenever I don't go see them* [his children] *then it means that I don't really have money because I don't like to go there empty handed.* (Peter)

Therefore, these men reflect hegemonic masculinity by understanding their relationship with their children as being financially dependent. Peter's sentiment, above, echoes this view, saying that he prefers not to go to his children "empty handed" because he enjoys treating them to something from Pick 'n Pay. This reflects the findings in the literature review that fathers may disengage when unable to financially provide (Malinga, 2021). This suggests that a lack of money directly impacts the time he spends with his children and the bonds they can form. He also mentioned that he supports his children emotionally, saying:

> *Uh, emotionally yes, but money wise I won't really say, I do support them, but not as fully as I'm supposed to … I'm, I'm not shy to say it, I am man enough to stand up to my mistakes you know.*

The word “mistake” implies that he feels responsibility and regret for his inability to support his children’s financial needs.

Challenges of Fatherhood

Responsibility and financial obligations were the two common challenges that came up in the interviews. Dominant conceptualisations of fatherhood assert that a father’s responsibilities include, but are not limited to, protecting and supporting their children (Chauke & Khunou, 2014; Malherbe & Kaminer, 2020). The discourse on fathers as breadwinners persists among men from low socio-economic settings, who associate manhood with meeting the family’s financial and emotional needs (Malherbe & Kaminer, 2020). Therefore, it is not surprising that these were some of the participants’ responses after being asked about the challenges of fatherhood:

> *As a man first financially is the main* [challenge of fatherhood], *cause now must have enough finance to pay for support them, cause now there is everything its expensive, … if you are able to make groceries like it should last a week or a month but for us you can’t do that, but you need a lot of cash. You have to try maintain that before that one is up there is another, another. Mostly, it’s financial.* (Gathii)

> *Yoh, challenge is that, is is like, challenge sometimes like finance, sometimes becomes a challenge in the family. And also, to, to make sure that, to have, have food in your house.* (Elijah)

In addition, Ahadi was asked if providing for his children is a challenge and he said “*yes, yes, yes, yes, yes, yes*”. Financial responsibility presented itself as a challenge for the formally employed (Themba and Elijah) and self-employed (Ahadi and Gathii) car guards. This financial challenge is representative of the precariousness of car guarding work in that the income is unpredictable due to a reliance on tips (Foster et al., 2021).

Benefits of Fatherhood

Responsibility appeared as a challenge *and* a benefit of fatherhood. Responsibility for their children came with additional benefits, such as gaining respect from family members, "becoming" a man and displaying self-respect in order to set a good example for their children. Interestingly, the child participants in Mercier et al.'s (2022) study valued their fathers because they were good examples and provided them with emotional support. This is equally important to Ahadi, who highlights the benefits of fatherhood below:

> *I have responsibility … I know I have to respect myself because I have children because if I do bad things, how, what am I teaching for my, for my children?*

Adam was the only one who was unable to speak to the benefits of fatherhood, saying *"I can't actually tell you what benefit it is. Because I am here, I'm there, to keep them alive."* Interestingly, he did not struggle to touch on the challenges of fatherhood, saying *"it's not easy, it's not like pocket money to like raise a child*." This shows that some men may not see any benefits associated with fatherhood. One of the reasons for this may be the general responsibility of parenting paired with the overwhelming expectation of fathers to be actively involved in various aspects of their child's life. The following section will discuss the roles the participating fathers adopt, which will reveal that, despite traditional gender roles, they place more value on roles outside of the financial realm.

The Roles Fathers Adopt

Six of the participants touched on their efforts to provide for their children financially. This corresponds with Enderstein and Boonzaier (2013) and Lesch et al.'s (2021) findings where fathers see material provision as their primary duty. However, some fathers seemed to place more value on physical roles. Four participants highlighted the importance of spending time with their children, linking back to how they described their relationship with their children:

Actually, most of the time when it gets dark, that's the only time when I like spending time with them because, because like when the next day come, before the sun come up, I'm like back on the road to look for, for the loose pieces to provide for the table. (Adam)

You must spend time, I do spend time… (Gathii)

Eh, my relationship with my children I think we be having a good relationship cause uh I, I know my children and I spend some time knowing them more and, also trying to, trying to understand, what would they like and all that. (Elijah)

Peter and Elijah mentioned their participation in physical parenting roles, such as bathing and feeding. Peter said, *"I like to wash my kids, … I always used to fight with my wife, let me do it, I want to do it, it's my thing, I love it."* The participants' involvement in these activities confirms that fatherly support extends beyond financial duties for some fathers (Lesch et al., 2021). Placing value on quality time with their children and assuming nurturing roles speaks to the emergence of "new fathers" who engage in caregiving roles. Moreover, Peter and Elijah touched on their ability to teach their children skills and life lessons, thus extending their parenting roles beyond the financial realm:

For me fatherhood is all about achievement … I can also teach my younger generation, I can teach them from the mistakes I've made in the past. (Peter)

Friday sometimes I go out to the field, the garden, teach them [his children] *… how to plough.* (Adam)

The nature of the fathers' precarious work plays a salient role in their ability to adopt various caregiving roles. Thus, although they value bathing, quality time and teaching their

children skills, they are still faced with the challenge of meeting the family's financial needs. The participating fathers do this through car guarding, which will be addressed in the following section.

The Nature of Car Guarding in Cape Town

This theme will address the other focus of this study, car guarding. It shall be unpacked through men's definitions of their work and the challenges and benefits they associate with it. All participants in this study defined car guarding along roughly the same lines, focusing on long working hours, risk and little to no pay, much like participants in Malinga (2021) and Enderstein and Boonzaier's (2013) South African studies. When asked to describe the work they do, they reflected Foster et al. (2021) and Munck et al.'s, (2021) conceptualisations of car guarding:

> *Ok, just watch cars and make sure maybe like now when there is wind like this, someone should not open and bang the others. Watch just anything suspicious, make sure they don't steal stuff from the car.* (Gathii)

> *Sometimes I've helped them* [drivers] *look for their cars and yah just looking care or taking care of the cars of customers when they do their shopping.* (Tuma, 28)

Thus, the participants view car guarding work as security work where they should protect the parked cars and assist motorists with finding their vehicles. Additionally, the participants' responses revealed that car guarding is physically demanding, busy, unpredictable and tiring, exacerbated by the fact that they spend most of the day on their feet and have to be prepared for challenges (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Malinga & Ratele, 2022). This is expressed by Tuma who said that the work is so tiring and busy that *"I have my lunch you know standing and moving around until yah the late hours of the day"*.

While some participants enjoyed car guarding more than others, there was a consensus that the work was temporary until a better opportunity presented itself. In fact, Ahadi did not view car guarding as a form of long-term employment, but rather as a steppingstone to finding a better career:

> *Okay, this work I'm doing you know, like eh, especially … we don't have a choice, that's why I'm doing this job. Just a couple of years and after I'm going to look to do something better than this one.* (Ahadi)

This aligns with the nature of precarious work being temporary, non-standard employment that people practice out of necessity and desperation as opposed to a chosen career path (Campbell & Price, 2016; Standing, 2014). The participants noted additional challenges that come with car guarding, which will be highlighted in the next section.

Challenges of Car Guarding

As noted above, the nature of car guarding work is tiring, unpredictable and busy. The participants in this study expressed several other challenges of car guarding, including poor pay, unpredictable income, risky encounters and xenophobia which are discussed below. The following extract is the perfect synopsis of how participants described the challenges of car guarding.

> *You see these, these, these jobs we are doing, we don't get paid, we are surviving with the tips.* (Ahadi)

Foster et al. (2021) noted that it is increasingly difficult to earn an income from car guarding as seen by most participants in their study who rely on tips alone. Of the nine participants in this study, five identified as self-employed car guards who rely on tips instead of salaries (Coetzee et al., 2015; Rubery et al., 2018). The remainder were employed by a security agency; however the salary they received was not enough to sustain them:

> *Eh, most of the time I rely on the tips but yah there is also a, you know, a standard salary of about 800 a month but yah most times I rely on the tips.* (Tuma)

Significantly, every single participant said that the money they receive for their work does not equal the time, effort, and sacrifices that they put in, much like Foster and Chasomeris's (2017) and Steyn et al.'s (2015) South African participants who felt their pay was not a fair remuneration for the work they did. For instance, Akida said *"the money is, is very half"* to the effort he puts in and Themba said "*we are earning peanuts as security guards*."

It is important to note that despite self-employed car guards' minimal income, they are made to pay a fee to work at an allocated parking bay. Gathii noted that he is expected to give a certain percentage of his daily earnings to two men who assign allocated parking bays to guarantee his working spot:

> *No, this this thing is, is organised by two guys. Those who are on top, now the difference between these and other jobs, these ones you don't get paid. You pay them for you to stand here. So, there's a a percentage, a certain percentage you must give them then they will let you stand here. So, you don't give they will put someone else who will give…*

In Foster et al.'s (2021) study this daily fee ranged from ZAR5 at the beach, to ZAR35 in malls and other shopping centres and was increasing each year. Gathii explained that he was running at a loss because he had to use his tips to pay for an allocated parking area:

> *… you are running at a loss. Cause here you must pay say 80 rand for standing there* [allocated car guarding spot]. *Let's say at the end of the day you have made 100 of which you must first deduct the 80 rand you gave from the 100 you made; you find you are left with 20.*

Despite this financial loss, he perseveres because he needs the money to *"see to the child's wellbeing".* Thus, car guarding becomes a necessity to financially provide for one's family. However, reliance on tips adds to the unpredictability of the work:

> *the days are not the same because we are getting money because how the customer tips. So today can be good, tomorrow can be bad, so you don't know exactly, how much you gonna make in the month.* (Ahadi)

In South Africa, customers pay car guards at their own discretion, which is sometimes nothing at all (Foster et al., 2021). This uncertainty means that car guards do not know whether they will earn enough in a month to fulfil their financial obligations (Malinga, 2021). Besides the financial uncertainty, car guarding can also be emotionally taxing. This became evident when some of the participants touched on being disrespected by customers. Tuma said that customers sometimes refused to talk to or even look at him. One participant even experienced xenophobic comments from customers when trying to help them:

> *Sometimes someone, a customer, he can park wrong and when you tell him "Sir, madam" they shout at you, say something bad to you, see? … So they start telling you "Ah fuck off, this is not your country". So sometimes it's bad.* (Ahadi)

Xenophobia within South Africa can exist in the form of aggressive language, as seen above, as well as violent attacks and murders (Mlambo, 2019). Migrant car guards' experiences of xenophobia highlight the dangers and risks to which they are exposed (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Foster & Chasomeris, 2017). Significantly, car guarding puts immigrants and locals at risk, with Adam (a local) noting that he was *"putting my life on the line"* and Themba (a migrant) emphasising risk as his primary work concern saying "*security is all about the risk. The only thing that is my concern is only the risk"*. All participants noted danger as a challenge of their work as they are protecting cars from break ins and thefts (Thobane & Prinsloo, 2018).

Benefits of Car Guarding

Despite the many challenges associated with car guarding, participants felt there were some benefits:

> *Ya I would say, I would say ya there are benefits like where I see them as … you won't afford here and there but for now I can afford ya.* (Themba)

Themba is grateful for his job because he can earn some money and support his family. High unemployment in South Africa has made people grateful for any job, regardless of the pay (Foster & Chasomeris, 2017; McEwen & Leiman, 2008). Although some customers can be rude, others can be kind and generous, with one participant saying:

> *It all depends on luck. It's tips mostly. You find a good guy like you come tip me 100. Now someone says uh since this guy is standing here, go inside bring uh, cool drink lunch for you. There are, there are just tips.* (Gathii)

This came up in several of the interviews where participants said that friendly and generous customers made their work more tolerable. Some gave drinks and tips, while others gave advice and gifts for the men's children. Ahadi even said that a customer may support you and say, *"go to school"*. Therefore, many participants were able to adopt a positive attitude that helped them find joy in their work through what customers gave and did for them, including possible job opportunities. This connects to the earlier point that car guarding is considered a steppingstone until they can find something better (Foster et al., 2021; Steyn et al., 2015). In fact, Adam was even able to find other work while being a car guard:

> *Ya, some owners where I am now in* [direct location removed for ethical reasons] *they're like, give me a chance, give me a job maybe for six months or a year, you see how it goes but they can't actually keep you permanently on because they also got their own workers.* (Adam)

Thus, the vantage of car guarding provides some men with job opportunities that they may not have come across otherwise. However, there is no guarantee that a car guard will have such positive experiences. In fact, from our study of nine people, only two participants referenced a time that customers' generosity extended beyond tipping. Therefore, while these positive experiences are an advantage of car guarding, they are by no means guaranteed.

Barriers to Fatherhood

The interviews revealed that car guarding in and of itself, and the financial limitations associated with the work, are barriers that prevent fathers from being actively involved in their children's lives. However, there are other barriers that limit fathers' involvement too, including the relationship the father has with the mother of his child as well as his migrant status, which are discussed below.

Relationship Between the Mother and Father of the Child

The men who were in a relationship with the mother of their child were able to be more involved in the child's life through living together. Thandiwe said he had "*no troubles, no mistakes"* in his relationship with his wife and children. He emphasised the importance of being involved in his children's lives, creating trust and spending time with one another saying "*you need to have sometimes to have the time to play with them*" and "*when they run to me, they know daddy is not going to hit me back, he's going to talk to me*". This quote highlights a gentle type of parenting that is not always expressed in narratives with men. Thandiwe's physical involvement in his children's lives is made possible due to his living situation. Conversely, Ahadi is not in a relationship with the mother of his child and the child lives with their mother in Congo, making it challenging for Ahadi to be a physically present father:

> *I support her because we are not together, but she is the one who look after the children* (Ahadi)

Ahadi's absence causes him to revert to traditional ideas of fatherhood which focus on the breadwinner role and leave the nurturing aspects to the mother (Arnold & Bongiovi, 2013; Chauke & Khunou, 2014). This is in line with other research that argues a father's relationship with his partner will impact his relationship with his children (Cowan & Cowan, 2019; Poblete & Gee, 2018).

Migrant Status

Furthermore, many participants noted that migration caused them to break up with their partners. Ahadi, a migrant from Congo, said when referring to his relationship with his wife, "*I break up, because I came here in South Africa".* Ironically this migration occurred to find a job to look after his family and yet it limited the relationship he has with them. This complicated scenario is seen in other studies such as Blaauw and Pretorius (2022) and Malinga (2021) where attempts to fulfil traditional financial roles directly impact emotional and caring roles. Migration for work also directly impacts fathers' relationships with their children, as living in a different country limits their fulfilment of all their fatherly roles. Ahadi, who had not seen his child in 10 years said:

> *It's not easy because he's not gonna have, I don't know if he's gonna have good affection with me because he stay long with his mother, you see?*

This physical barrier prevents him from being actively involved in his child's life and while he may financially provide for his child, he has not been able to have a relationship with him. Thus, migration directly impacted his emotional bond with his child. Of the nine participants in this study, seven had migrated for work, leaving their families behind. Therefore, the quest for employment and financial security may limit fathers' abilities to fulfil their paternal roles (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Malinga, 2015). There are several other factors that affect car guards' abilities to fulfil their fatherly roles, which will be discussed below.

Structural Factors that Impact Fathers and Car Guards in South Africa

Thematic analysis revealed factors in South Africa that present challenges for the participating fathers to fulfil their desired parenting ideals, as well as society's ideals of fathers as breadwinners. Thus, this theme will outline the complexities that surround the relationship between precarious work and fatherhood in South Africa. The normative assumption of fathers as breadwinners is not realistic for many black South African families due to apartheid's legacy of marginalising black people, resulting in many black men suffering the effects of unemployment and economic pressure (Ratele et al., 2012). Reference to financial hardship experienced through car guarding came up in multiple interviews:

> *... according to me, the effort like that I'm putting to my work like the money that I'm earning is not worth it because we do maybe get bonuses, but you can see that no, this is not enough by the way that you look it.* (Themba)

> *... to pay the school fees is just a little bit of a problem … And like bread and stuff is not cheap, you can't buy actually R1000 groceries cause there's not enough.* (Adam)

These responses demonstrate that car guarding is not an adequate job. However, many felt it was better than nothing because *"the benefits of that* [car guarding] *is also surviving you know, because people do give the money and we do survive"* (Peter). This emphasises that high rates of poverty have made people grateful for any amount of money that allows them, and their families, to survive (Arndt et al., 2020; Pruett et al., 2017).

Crea et al. (2017) found that migrants dominate the car guarding business, which correlates with the participants in this study, seven of which are migrant workers (see Appendix A). Some of the men are qualified for specific jobs yet they find themselves occupying car guarding positions because they simply *"don't have a choice"* (Ahadi). This follows Foster and Chasomeri's (2017) findings that many car guards in Durban, South

Africa, had qualifications and experience. However, according to Steyn et al. (2015) and McEwen and Leiman (2008), who studied car guards in Tshwane and Cape Town respectively, found foreigners to be more qualified than local South Africans. This contradicts the findings in this study, whereby Tuma had the highest academic qualification – a human resources diploma – but was a local migrant from the Eastern Cape. Thus, regardless of qualification and/or migrant status, people are being forced into car guarding. Arnold and Bongiovi (2013) and Foster et al. (2021) noted that the prevalence of car guarding in South Africa can be attributed to the shortage of formal job vacancies. As a result, these fathers are spending countless hours car guarding because it is a way for them to "*put bread on the table for my kids"* (Tuma).

The "New Father" and Car Guarding

As mentioned above, car guarding is often taken up so that men may fulfil their breadwinner roles within the family (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Foster et al., 2021; Malinga, 2021). It is therefore worth noting how car guarding impacts experiences of fatherhood at both a financial and emotional level. Themba, when asked how often he sees his children, said:

> *Since I've been here ne, like uhmm I didn't have much time to go home because, um, didn't apply for my leave and I was like, I have to finish a year before you apply for leave, but if there's something, maybe a ritual thing, maybe any function that is happening there back home, I got a chance to go there, and then I often see them.*

Although Themba's formal employment allows him to earn more than his self-employed counterparts, he still faces barriers such as not being able to travel home when he wishes. This further emphasises that car guarding allows most fathers to fulfil financial expectations but not emotional or caregiving ones (Blaauw & Pretorius, 2022; Steyn, 2018).

Furthermore, car guarding limits the time fathers who live at home can spend with their children. Tuma said:

> *I would really like to spend time with my kids, but you know sometimes with this kind of job I'm doing, becomes difficult you know … when I come back from work they are sleeping sometimes when I leave, they are also on their way to school so yah.*

Thus, Tuma finds it challenging to extend his involvement beyond his financial contributions. This indicates that it is difficult for car guards to find time to work *and* be active in the emotional and physical aspects of parenting even when they live with their children. Adam echoed the difficulty of work preventing him from spending time with his children, but said he must be in his children's lives to *"show them better things in the life further. Who's gonna show them the right and wrong?"*. This indicates that he places value on guiding his children, but he cannot give up this job because he needs the money to support his family and pay rent to his parents, something he feels is his responsibility saying, "*actually my whole family where I'm like staying in the house, and actually I don't stay actually for, for nothing, doesn't matter if it's my parents, I still have to rent"*.

Therefore, despite several fathers noting that fatherly roles include spending quality time with their children and getting to know one another, they are limited in doing this due to the long hours and unreliable income of their work. There was an exception, however, seen in Thandiwe's response. He did not let work interfere with his parenting roles, but used his work experience to help him be a better father. He approached his work and family life the same way, arguing that you need to have care, compassion and kindness when dealing with both your children and those at work:

> *I say now at work or at my home, I have children and I'm still going to work with children also at work … You need to still have to do the same what you doing to your children, to act like that … so the challenges that I get in here* [at his place of work], *I know*

that I'm going to get at my house also with my children. So that's why I have the understanding all the time.

Thandiwe was an involved father and the only participant that noted correlations between his work and family life. As shown in an earlier section (p. 15), he emphasised that a parent needed to spend time with their children, develop trust and teach their children beyond just financially providing for them.

Thandiwe was able to achieve this due to minimal barriers to active fathering – he lived with his children and had a good relationship with his wife. Furthermore, he is a formally employed car guard which gives him the benefit of more financial security and, in turn, less stress, allowing him to spend his free time with his children. This is a luxury that self-employed car guards are denied (Foster et al., 2021).

This finding is significant as it shows that despite the constraints presented by car guarding, some men are still able to father in ways that contradict 'traditional' patterns which limit men to financial provision (Gregory & Milner, 2011; Nelson, 2004). While this revelation is significant, it is important to note that Thandiwe was the only participant in this study that, due to minimal barriers, seemed to easily fulfil both his financial and emotional responsibilities. Other participants emphasised the importance of emotional contributions alongside financial, but noted several barriers to this such as car guarding's financial limitations, long working hours, migration and their living situations. Thus, Thandiwe's experience is not a norm but an exception.

Reflection

When reflecting on this research, it is important to consider our positionality as young, English-speaking women. As such, we were only able to reflect on English experiences, which risks continuing the Eurocentric presentation of research that neglects non-English voices. The decision to extract car guards' experiences from the pool of data

consisting of waiters, lecturers, and car guards felt appropriate given their limited attention in previous research. This allowed us to highlight their experiences alone, without being overshadowed by others. However, neither of us are parents, and could not relate to experiences of fatherhood and the societal expectation to financially provide for one's family. While we engaged with the data as best as we could, it is possible that we failed to grasp certain complexities and may have interpreted the participants' experiences with previous literature in mind. Although we acknowledge that using secondary data removed us from the original data, we were able to begin analysis without any biases which allowed the data to speak for itself. Immersing ourselves in the data through transcription and analysis gave us an appreciation for the experiences of car guards, a population often overlooked and taken for granted by society.

Summary and Conclusion

The population of fathers who engage in car guarding work has been neglected in previous literature. Policies are calling for the implementation of interventions that will promote active fatherly involvement in South Africa. This will not be successful if the needs of every niche population, such as car guards, are not individually met. Previously, fatherhood has been viewed through a generalised, one-dimensional lens that focused on financial provision. In reality, fatherhood consists of a dynamic range of social, economic, and cultural factors. Unfortunately, ideals pertaining to hegemonic masculinity are still embedded in South African discourse, media, and society at large. These ideals also came through during data analysis, where the majority of the participating men based their understanding of their roles as fathers on the fulfilment of financial obligations. However, when asked what fatherhood means to them, a few of the men reflected on fatherhood as a responsibility to look after someone other than themselves instead of labelling it a financial responsibility. One of the ways in which they achieved this was through car guarding.

However, car guarding ironically limits fathers' abilities to meet their financial *and* emotional expectations owing to minimal income, migration and long working hours that prevent them from spending time with their children. Only one participant in this study was able to fulfil his financial and emotional obligations, suggesting that car guarding by its very nature limits fatherly involvement, engendering feelings of failure. Future research may benefit from exploring how these feelings of failure affect fathers' emotional states as well as their relationships with their children. Additionally, we recommend that parenting programmes incorporate the "new father" phenomenon, teaching fathers nurturing skills that can be applied both in person and, for migrant workers, over the phone.

Limitations

One of the limitations of this study is that we did not collect our own data and relied on secondary data, which prevented us from asking additional questions. In addition, the fact that English is our only language, combined with the unavailability of a translator, meant that we were limited to the 10 English interviews. This limited the experiences and voices that our study was able to hear and report on.

Another limitation is the possibility of social desirability. Men are becoming aware of the "new father" phenomenon, which might lead to social desirability (Hunter et al., 2017). Their self-reports represent societal expectations of fathers being engaged in the financial and emotional elements of fatherhood. It is difficult to explore whether these self-reports are genuine or if they merely reflect social desirability (Vesely & Klöckner, 2020).

Significance

The findings of this study might contribute to policy and intervention work that seeks to reduce the stigma around men doing care work. Changing the perceptions of fatherhood will allow men to find value in caring masculinities when unable to fulfil financial responsibilities. Additionally, it may change cultural ideologies of masculinity and prevent

men from reacting violently and/or disengaging from their families when unable to provide financially.

References

Arndt, C., Davies, R., Gabriel, S., Harris, L., Makrelov, K., Robinson, S., Levy, S., Simbanegavi, W., Seventer, D., & Anderson, L. (2020). Covid-19 lockdowns, income distribution, and food security: An analysis for South Africa. *Global food security*, *26*, 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gfs.2020.100410

Arnold, D., & Bongiovi, J. R. (2013). Precarious, informalising, and flexible work: Transforming concepts and understandings. *American Behavioural Scientist*, *57*(3), 289–308. https://doi.org/10.1177/0002764212466239

Blaauw, P. F., & Pretorius, M. (2022). "I am 30 and I have nothing": The context of reception and the lived experiences of foreign migrants working as car guards in Johannesburg's West Rand. *GeoJournal*, *41*(1), 1–15. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10708-022-10594-8

Black, N. (1994). Why we need qualitative research. *Journal of Epidemiology and Community Health*, *48*(5), 425–426. https://doi.org/10.1136/jech.48.5.425-a

Blee, K. M., & Taylor, V. (2002). Semi-structured interviewing in social movement research. *Methods of Social Movement Research*, *16*, 92–117.

Blount, M., & Cunningham, G. (2014). *Representing black men*. Routledge.

Boonzaier, F. (2018). Challenging risk: The production of knowledge on gendered violence in South Africa. In *Intimate Partner Violence, Risk and Security* (pp. 71–87). Routledge.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *3*(2), 77–101. https://doi.org/10.1191/1478088706qp063oa

Campbell, I., & Price, R. (2016). Precarious work and precarious workers: Towards an improved conceptualisation. *The Economic and Labour Relations Review*, *27*(3), 314–332. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1035304616652074

Census. (2011). *Income dynamics and poverty status of households in South Africa.* https://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/Report-03-10-10/Report-03-10-102014.pdf

Chauke, P., & Khunou, G. (2014). Shaming fathers into providers: Child support and fatherhood in the South African media. *The Open Family Studies Journal, 6,* 18–23. https://doi.org/10.2174/1874922401406010018

Chili, S., & Maharaj, P. (2015). 'Becoming a father': Perspectives and experiences of young men in Durban, South Africa. *South African review of Sociology, 46*(3), 28–44. https://doi.org/10.1080/21528586.2015.105975

Coetzee, A., Steyn, F., & Klopper, H. (2015). A survey of car guards in Tshwane: Implications for private security policy and practice. *SA Crime Quarterly, 52,* 15–24. https://doi.org/10.4314/sacq.v52i1.2

Connell, R. W., & Messerschmidt, J. W. (2005). Hegemonic masculinity: Rethinking the concept. *Gender & Society, 19*(6), 829–859. https://doi.org/10.1177/0891243205278639

Connelly, L. M. (2014). Ethical considerations in research studies. *MedSurg Nursing, 23*(1), 54–55.

Cowan, C. P., & Cowan, P. A. (2019). Enhancing parenting effectiveness, fathers' involvement, couple relationship quality, and children's development: Breaking down silos in family policy making and service delivery. *Journal of Family Theory & Review, 11*(1), 92–111. https://doi.org/10.1111/jftr.12301

Crea, T. M., Loughry, M., O'Halloran, C., & Flannery, G. J. (2017). Environmental risk: Urban refugees' struggles to build livelihoods in South Africa. *International Social Work, 60*(3), 667–682. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0020872816631599

Creswell, J. W. (2013). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Sage Publications.

Enderstein, A., & Boonzaier, F. (2013). Narratives of young South African fathers: Redefining masculinity through fatherhood. *Journal of Gender Studies, 24*(5), 512–527. https://doi.org/10.1080/09589236.2013.856751

Farrugia, B. (2019). WASP (write a scientific paper): Sampling in qualitative research. *Early Human Development, 133*, 69–71. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.earlhumdev.2019.03.016

Field, S., Onah, M., van Heyningen, T., & Honikman, S. (2018). Domestic and intimate partner violence among pregnant women in a low resource setting in South Africa: A facility-based, mixed methods study. *BMC Women's Health*, *18*(1), 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12905-018-0612-2

Foster, J., & Chasomeris, M. (2017). Examining car guarding as a livelihood in the informal sector. *Local Economy*, *32*(6), 525–538. https://doi.org/10.1177/0269094217727990

Foster, J., Chasomeris, M., & Blaauw, D. (2021). Re-visiting car guarding as a livelihood in the informal sector. *Development Southern Africa, 38*(5), 769–784. https://doi.org/10.1080/0376835X.2021.1891862

Green, J., & Thorogood, N. (2018). *Qualitative methods for health research*. Sage.

Gregory, A., & Milner, S. (2011). What is "new" about fatherhood?: The social construction of fatherhood in France and the UK. *Men and Masculinities, 14*(5), 588–606. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1097184X11412940

Heinz, M., Keane, E., & Davison, K. (2021). Gender in initial teacher education: Entry patterns, intersectionality and a dialectic rationale for diverse masculinities in schooling. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1080/02619768.2021.1890709

Hunter, S. C., Riggs, D. W., & Augoustinos, M. (2017). Hegemonic masculinity versus a caring masculinity: Implications for understanding primary caregiving fathers. *Social and Personality Psychology Compass, 11*(3), 1–9. https://doi.org/10.1111/spc3.12307

Jayachandran, S. (2021). Social norms as a barrier to women's employment in developing countries. *IMF Economic Review*, *69*(3), 576–595. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41308-021-00140-w

Jewkes, R., Morrell, R., Hearn, J., Lundqvist, E., Blackbeard, D., Lindegger, G., Quayle, M., Sikweyiya, Y., & Gottzen, L. (2015). Hegemonic masculinity: Combining theory and practice in gender interventions. *Culture, Health & Sexuality*, *17*(2), 112–127. https://doi.org/10.1080/13691058.2015.1085094

Johansson, T. (2011). The construction of the new father: How middle-class men become present fathers. *International Review of Modern Sociology*, *37*(1), 121–136. https://www.jstor.org/stable/41421402

Kalleberg, A. L. (2012). Job quality and precarious work. *Work and Occupations*, *39*(4), 427–448. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0730888412460533

Koenig-Visagie, L. H., & van Eeden, J. (2013). Gendered representations of fatherhood in contemporary South African church imagery from three Afrikaans corporate churches. *Verbum et Ecclesia*, *34*(1), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.4102/ve.v34i1.760

LaRossa, R. (1988). Fatherhood and social change. *Family Relations, 37*(4), 451–457. https://doi.org/10.2307/584119

LaRossa, R. (2007). The culture and conduct of fatherhood in America, 1800 to 1960. *Kazoku syakaigaku kenkyu*, *19*(2), 87–98. https://doi.org/10.4234/jjoffamilysociology.19.2_87

le Roux, M., & Lesch, E. (2022). Exploring the caring of fathers in low-income, rural communities in South Africa. *Journal of Family Studies*, *1*(1), 1–24. https://doi.org/10.1080/13229400.2022.2035246

Lesch, E., Gittings, L., Dunn, S., Maharaj, P., Louw, H., Enderstein, A., Nell, E.,

Nordien-Lagardien, R., & Pretorius, B. (2021). Father connections and disconnections. In W. Van den Berg, T. Makusha & K. Ratele (Eds.), *State of South Africa's Fathers 2021* (pp. 26–49). Stellenbosch University.

Lesch, E., & Kelapile, C. (2016). "In my dream she finds me…and she wants me just the way I am.": Fatherhood experiences of unmarried men in South Africa. *Men and Masculinities, 19*(5), 503–523. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1097184X15601476

Makusha, T., Van den Berg, W., & Ratele, K. (2021). Conclusion: The diverse and complex nature of fatherhood in South Africa. In W. Van den Berg, T. Makusha & K. Ratele (Eds.), *State of South Africa's Fathers 2021* (pp. 161–172). Stellenbosch University.

Malinga, M. (2016). Precarious employment and fathering practices among African men (Doctoral thesis). Available from University of South Africa Theses and Dissertations (Psychology). http://hdl.handle.net/10500/20283

Malinga, M. (2021). Economic provision and fatherhood. In W. Van den Berg, T. Makusha & K. Ratele (Eds.), *State of South Africa's Fathers 2021* (pp. 73–94). Stellenbosch University.

Malinga, M., & Ratele, K. (2022). Fatherhood among marginalised work-seeking men in South Africa. In M. Grau, M. las Heras Maestro & H. Bowles (Eds.), *Engaged Fatherhood for Men, Families and Gender Equality* (pp. 265–278). Springer. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-75645-1_15

McEwen, H., & Leiman, A. (2008). The car guards of Cape Town: A public good analysis. *South African Labour Development Research Unit Working Paper Series, 25,* 1–24.

Mercier, E., Le Couteur, A., & Delfabbro, P. (2022). 'I am different': A qualitative analysis of part-time working fathers' constructions of their experiences. *Community, Work & Family*, 1–17. https://doi.org/10.1080/13668803.2022.2045904

Mlambo, D. N. (2019). A South African perspective on immigrants and Xenophobia in post-1994 South Africa. *African Renaissance, 16*(4), 53–67. https://doi.org/10.31920/2516-5305/2019/16n1a3

Morrell, R., Jewkes, R., & Lindegger, G. (2012). Hegemonic masculinity/masculinities in South Africa: Culture, power and gender politics. *Men and Masculinities, 15*, 11–30. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1097184X12438001

Mosoetsa, S., Stillerman, J., & Tilly, C. (2016). Precarious labour, south and north: An introduction. *International Labour and Working-Class History, 89*, 5–19. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0147547916000028

Munck, R., Pradella, L., & Wilson, T. D. (2020). Introduction: Special issue on precarious and informal work. *Review of Radical Political Economics, 52*(3), 361–370. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0486613420929205

Mvune, N., & Bhana, D. (2022). Caring masculinities? Teenage fathers in South Africa. *Journal of Family Studies*, 1-16. https://doi.org/10.1080/13229400.2022.2048962

Nelson, T. (2004). Low-income fathers. *Annual Review Of Sociology, 30*(1), 427–451. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.soc.29.010202.095947

Norlyk, A., & Harder, I. (2010). What makes a phenomenological study phenomenological? An analysis of peer-reviewed empirical nursing studies. *Qualitative Health Research, 20*(3), 420–431. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1049732309357435

Nowell, L. S., Norris, J. M., White, D. E., & Moules, N. J. (2017). Thematic analysis: Striving to meet the trustworthiness criteria. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 16*(1), 1-13. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1609406917733847

Ochsner, A. (2012). Fictions of uncertainty: The crisis of masculinity and fatherhood in 'ladlit'. *European Journal of Cultural Studies*, *15*(1), 89-104. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F1367549411424952

Poblete, A. T., & Gee, C. B. (2018). Partner support and grandparent support as predictors of change in coparenting quality. *Journal of child and family studies*, *27*(7), 2295–2304. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10826-018-1056-x

Pruett, M. K., Pruett, K., Cowan, C. P., & Cowan, P. A. (2017). Enhancing father involvement in low-income families: A couples group approach to preventive intervention. *Child Development*, *88*(2), 398–407. https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12744

Ratele, K. (2021). Fatherhood and violence. In W. Van den Berg, T. Makusha & K. Ratele (Eds.), *State of South Africa's Fathers 2021* (pp. 120-143). Stellenbosch University.

Ratele, K., Shefer, T., & Clowes, L. (2012). Talking South African fathers: A critical examination of men's constructions and experiences of fatherhood and fatherlessness. *South African Journal of Psychology*, *42*(4), 553–563. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F008124631204200409

Rubery, J., Grimshaw, D., Keizer, A., & Johnson, M. (2018). Challenges and contradictions in the "normalising" of precarious work. *Work, Employment and Society*, *32*(3), 509–527. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F0950017017751790

Salami, I. A., & Okeke, C. I. O. (2018). Absent fathers' socio-economic status and perceptions of fatherhood as related to developmental challenges faced by children in South Africa. *South African Journal of Childhood Education*, *8*(1), 1–7. https://doi.org/10.4102/sajce.v8i1.522

Scheibling, C. (2018). "Real heroes care": How dad bloggers are reconstructing

fatherhood and masculinities. *Men and Masculinities*, *23*(1), 3–19. https://doi.org/10.1177/1097184x18816506

Sikweyiya, Y., Shai, N., Gibbs, A., Mahlangu, P., & Jewkes, R. (2017). Conceptualisations of fatherhood and socio-contextual dynamics influencing father involvement in informal settlements in Durban, South Africa. *Social Dynamics*, *43*(1), 131–147. https://doi.org/10.1080/02533952.2017.1348039

Standing, G. (2014). Understanding the precariat through labour and work. *Development and Change* , *45*(5), 963–980. https://doi.org/10.1111/dech.12120

Statistics South Africa. (2021). *Quarterly Labour Force Survey (QLFS).* https://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0211/Presentation%20QLFS%20Q2_2021.pdf

Steyn, F. (2018). Fleeing to exploitation: The case of immigrants who work as car guards. *Tydskrif vir Geesteswetenskappe*, *58*(4-2), 925–939. https://doi.org/10.17159/2224-7912/2018/v58n4-2a4

Steyn, F., Coetzee, A., & Klopper, H. (2015). A survey of car guards in Tshwane: Implications for private security policy and practice. *South African Crime Quarterly*, *52*, 15–24. https://doi.org/10.4314/sacq.v52i1.2

Sundler, A. J., Lindberg, E., Nilsson, C., & Palmér, L. (2019). Qualitative thematic analysis based on descriptive phenomenology. *Nursing open*, *6*(3), 733–739. https://doi.org/10.1002/nop2.275

Thobane, M., & Prinsloo, J. (2018). Is crime getting increasingly violent? An assessment of the role of bank associated robbery in South Africa. *South African Crime Quarterly*, *65*, 33–41. https://doi.org/10.17159/2413-3108/2018/v0n65a4367

Valiquette-Tessier, S. C., Gosselin, J., Young, M., & Thomassin, K. (2019). A literature review of cultural stereotypes associated with motherhood and fatherhood.

Marriage & Family Review, *55*(4), 299–329. https://doi.org/10.1080/01494929.2018.1469567

Vesely, S., & Klöckner, C. A. (2020). Social Desirability in Environmental Psychology Research: Three Meta-Analyses. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *11*(1395), 1–9. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.01395

Yanow, D., & Schwartz-Shea, P. (2015). *Interpretation and method: Empirical research methods and the interpretive turn*. Routledge.

Appendix A

Interview Guide

UNIVERSITY OF CAPE TOWN

DEPARTMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY

Sample interview guide

Demographic Information:

- Can you please tell me about yourself...
    - Age
    - Home Town
    - First Language
    - Relationship status and family
    - Number of children you are fathering and their ages

Questions relating to precarious employment

- Please describe your line of work
    - What does it involve?
    - Can you please describe a ‘normal’ day at work for you

- Do you enjoy what you do?
- Are you remunerated well for what you do?
- Are there any challenges in your line of work? What are they?
- Are there any benefits in your line of work? What are they?
- Is this your first choice of work? If not, and if you could choose, what kind of work would you be doing?

Questions relating to fathering

- You indicated that you are a father, please tell me what that means to you?
- Please describe your relationship with your children.
  - Are you involved in their lives? If so, how?
  - Do you get to spend time with them?
    - What are the things that you do with them? o Do you provide emotional support?
  - Do you provide physical care (feed, bath etc.)?
  - Do you provide for their financial needs?
- What, according to your experience are the challenges to parenting as a men?
- What according to your experience are the benefits to parenting as a men?
- Does your work (including your working conditions) affect your ability to be involved in your children's lives? If so, how?

Appendix B

Ethical Clearance Letter

UNIVERSITY OF CAPE TOWN

Department of Psychology

University of Cape Town Rondebosch 7701 South Africa
Telephone (021) 650 3417
Fax No. (021) 650 4104

27 July 2018

Dr Mandisa Malinga
Department of Psychology
University of Cape Town
Rondebosch 7701

Dear Dr Malinga

I am pleased to inform you that ethical clearance has been given by an Ethics Review Committee of the Faculty of Humanities for your study, *Precarious employment and fathering practices of men in the formal and informal sectors*. The reference number is PSY2018-055.

I wish you all the best for your study.

Yours sincerely

Lauren Wild (PhD)
Associate Professor
Chair: Ethics Review Committee

Appendix C

Invitation to Participate

UNIVERSITY OF CAPE TOWN

DEPARTMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY

Invitation to participate

You are invited to participate in a research project titled '*Precarious employment and fathering practices of men in the formal and informal sectors*'

Aim of the study

The aim of the study is to understand the ways in which various forms of precarious employment shape fathering practices – the ways in which men 'do' fatherhood. While research has increasingly noted a decrease in permanent work and an increase in precarious work across the formal and informal sectors, few studies have explored the ways in which engaging in such work affects the lives of those involved. More specifically, fewer studies explore the ways in which precarious work affects men's involvement in their children's lives, a phenomenon that this study seeks to explore from the perspective of fathers who are involved in three forms of precarious work, those who work as car guards, waiters, and as lecturers.

Procedure

In order to participate, you have to be a father (self-defined) and work as one of the following: a car guard, waiter, or lecturer. Individual semi-structured face-to-face interviews will be conducted at a venue of your choosing, and will last between 60-90 minutes. Please note that these interviews will be recorded using an audio-recording device, and later transcribed and analysed, following which it will be written up for publication.

Ethical considerations

Any information you share during this study will be kept confidential. All audio- recordings and transcripts will be kept in a password-locked folder and will only be accessible to the researchers involved in this study. Any hardcopies produced including the signed consent forms will be kept in a lockable compartment that only the principal investigator will have access to. For the purposes of reporting, all names and identifiable information will be removed, and pseudonyms will be used in order to ensure that the data remains anonymous. You have the right to withdraw your participation from this study at any point without any negative consequences. Should you choose to do so, any data you have already provided will be destroyed and will not be used for the study.

Contact details

Should you be interested in participating in this study or have any questions about this project, please contact the principal investigator, Dr Mandisa Malinga (Psychology, UCT) at mandisa.malinga@uct.ac.za or on 021 650 4997. Alternatively, contact Rosalind Adams (Psychology, UCT) at Rosalind.adams@uct.ac.za or on 021 650 3417.

YOUR PARTICIPATION WILL BE HIGHLY APPRECIATED!!!

Appendix D

Consent Form

UNIVERSITY OF CAPE TOWN

DEPARTMENT OF PSYCHOLOGY

Consent Form

Thank you for agreeing to participate in this research project titled '*Precarious employment and fathering practices of men in the formal and informal sectors*'.

Purpose of the study

The aim of this study is to understand the ways in which various forms of precarious employment shape fathering practices – the ways in which men 'do' fatherhood. Your participation in this study will involve an individual face-to-face interview that is expected to last between 60-90 minutes. Each interview will be recorded using an audio- recording device, and will be later transcribed, analysed and written up for publication.

Ethical considerations

Any information you share during this study will be kept confidential. All audio- recordings and transcripts will be kept in a password-locked folder and will only be accessible to the researchers involved in this study. Any hardcopies produced including the signed consent

forms will be kept in a lockable compartment that only the principal investigator will have access to. For the purposes of reporting, all names and identifiable information will be removed, and pseudonyms will be used in order to ensure that the data remains anonymous. You have the right to withdraw your participation from this study at any point without any negative consequences. Should you choose to do so, any data you have already provided will be destroyed and will not be used for the study.

Benefits and risks

This study is expected to pose minimal emotional harm to you as the questions focus on the type of work that you do and whether and how it affects your involvement in your children's lives. Should you feel distressed at any point as a result of the study, you can inform the researcher who will arrange for you to seek professional help at a facility closest to you (see attached referral list). There will be no compensation for participating in this study. However, the researcher will provide lunch for the duration of the interview to make up for the time you have taken. The study has no direct benefits to you, but will contribute to what we know about precarious work and its impact on fathering. Most importantly, this study is expected to contribute to the drafting of a working document that informs interventions that are targeted at encouraging men to become more involved in their children's lives. We also hope that you will find useful this opportunity to voice any challenges and frustrations you might be experiencing as a father involved in precarious employment.

Contact details

Should you have any questions following this interview, please contact the principal investigator, Dr Mandisa Malinga (Psychology, UCT) at mandisa.malinga@uct.ac.za or on

021 650 4997. Alternatively, contact Rosalind Adams (Psychology, UCT) at Rosalind.adams@uct.ac.za or on 021 650 3417.

Consent

I [Name and Surname] confirm that the above study has been explained to me and all questions have been answered by the researcher. I fully understand the implications of my participation, and am aware that I can withdraw from this study at any point should I no longer wish to participate. I hereby confirm that I agree to participate in this study, and give my consent for the information I share to be used in any publication for this project without the disclosure of any information that will make me identifiable by others.

Signature..... Date..... (Participant)

I also give my consent to be recorded using an audio-recording device during the interview.

Signature..... Date..... (Participant)

Signature..... Date..... (Researcher)

Appendix E

Demographic Table

No:	Pseudonym:	Age:	Place of birth:	Type of work:	Number of children:
1.	Themba	34	East London	Security guard/Access control	2
2.	Adam	38	Cape Town, Bokaap	Car guard	2
3.	Thandiwe	39	Cape Town	Security guard	3
4.	Peter	32	N/A	Car guard Recycles	2
5.	Ahadi	37	Congo	Car guard	1
6.	Akida	25	Tanzania	Car guard	2
7.	Gathii	N/A	Nairobi, Kenya	Car guard	2
8.	Tuma	28	Johannesburg	Car guard at a complex	2
9.	Elijah	27	Kimberley	Car guard	2