

‘Lalela: occupying knowledge practices and processes in higher education in South Africa’ (UCT as case study)

Seminar Paper presented by June Bam-Hutchison

[*This is an edited, fuller and updated version¹ of the paper presented at the seminar.]

Anthropology, HUMA, ²Neville Alexander Building, UCT

1 March 2016

¹ At the end of March, South Africa witnessed a major historical turning point on constitutionality (discussed in the original version of this paper). These aspects have been updated in this version. I am greatly indebted to the Social Anthropology department for inviting me to present this ‘opening’ seminar and to my colleagues at the APC (Carolyn Hamilton, Duane Jethro and Memory Biwa) who supported me with beginning this conversation. This updated version also benefitted hugely from the responses from students and staff to the paper, and the ongoing debates in the department.

² I make references to the intellectual contributions of the late Neville Alexander in this paper as a tribute.

In response to an important intellectual disruption by the #Rhodes Must Fall (#RMF) protests last year in October 2015, the APC held a series of conversations (originally crafted as papers for a research development workshop). As the biggest student protest movement the country has seen in higher education since 1994, this revolutionary moment became popularly dubbed by the media as the historic 'class of 2015'. Ubiquitous placards highlighted the slow transformation of higher education institutions, unequal education provision, and the related matters of workers' rights. For those who have lived through apartheid activism, the protest events were perhaps reminiscent of many a UDF moment in the 1980s in South Africa, when a united front of workers and students militantly challenged the apartheid state and brought about a historic turning point in the toppling of Nationalist Party rule and segregationist policies – albeit only a decade later, and with much of the systemic trappings of apartheid still firmly in place over thirty years later.

Yet we have made considerable gains. We now have a new Constitution, a Human Rights Commission, a Constitutional Court, new curricula. But we also have a new black elite showing off visible decadence, a small but very visible poor white class begging at traffic lights (their black counterparts in the same space remain invisible; they were always there), much unchanged opulent and well serviced white residential areas, and a relatively invisible massive black poor class far removed to the outskirts of the city of Cape Town.

Significant, but sometimes too small, gains have been made in crucial areas of social and economic justice and there seems (what can be interpreted as) an increasing alienation from the Constitution (within the ruling party, political power circles and on the ground). There is also a growing tendency within the citizenry to discard the new systemic democratic processes and human rights enshrined in the Constitution³, and we have a situation where legal cases are made to call to book

³ For example, this is evident in the general defiance shown by the student movement of South Africa's National Heritage Resources Act nr 25 of 1999. (This Act aimed 'to empower civil society to nurture and conserve their heritage resources so that they can be bequeathed to future generations' includes imprisonment for defacing of monuments, such as those which occurred nationwide in 2015). Through #RMF

certain members within the ruling party in terms of the Constitution.⁴ South Africa is clearly facing a deepening democratic crisis after the recent Constitutional Court ruling on President Zuma and Nkandla, which has led to widespread mass mobilisation (including within the ruling party) calling for the stepping down of the president.⁵ International eyes are also on South Africa regarding constitutionality with influential newspapers like *The New York Times* publishing an article by South African Mark Gevisser⁶ for President Zuma to step down⁷.

Some scholars call this deepening crisis in constitutionality in South Africa ‘an unravelling of CODESA and of 1994’.⁸ In this regard, the warnings of economist and

South Africa’s black youth militantly contests the consensus notion that colonial and apartheid statues and monuments are ‘their heritage’. Furthermore, as ‘king of the Zulu nation’, King Goodwill Zwelithini’s inflammatory speech in 2015 was blamed for recent xenophobic attacks. See <http://www.timeslive.co.za/local/2015/04/16/listen-to-exactly-what-king-goodwill-zwelithini-said-about-foreigners>. Zwelithini referred in this translated speech to Africans from other countries on the continent as those ‘who dirty our streets’. Another example of defiance of the Constitution is the recent open racial conflict at the University of Free State’s Varsity Cup match in response to protests by ‘Outsourcing Must Fall’ protests. See <http://ewn.co.za/2016/02/23/UFS-suspends-classes-after-black-vs-white-brawl>. The ANC-aligned civic movement has since launched a UDF-type alliance Anti-Racism Network South Africa (ARNSA) with hashtag #TakeOnRacism in its recognition in the words of ANC stalwart Ahmed Kathrada that ‘racism squanders human capital’. Human Rights Day has now been rebranded as ‘National Anti-Racism Week’ from 14-21 March. See <http://ewn.co.za/2016/03/10/OPINION-Ahmed-Kathrada-Lets-recommit-to-non-racialism>

⁴ Referring here, for instance, to the recent Constitutional Court ruling on 31 March 2016 that President Zuma has failed to uphold and respect the constitution on the matter of the unapproved spending on his Nkandla homestead. <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/zuma-violated-oath-of-office-and-constitution-trengove-20160209>. <http://mg.co.za/article/2016-04-05-concourt-did-find-zuma-did-not-uphold-constitution> Also, the questioning of the constitutionality of the Marikana shootings of August 2012 in a democratic post-apartheid South Africa. <http://mg.co.za/article/2015-08-17-marikana-massacre-and-neoliberal-plunder>.

⁵ <http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/zuma-must-step-down-as-sa-president-but-remain-party-leader-say-some-gauteng-anc-leaders-20160413>

⁶ Author of the biography *The Dream Deferred: Thabo Mbeki*, Jonathan Ball Publishers, 2007

⁷ http://www.nytimes.com/2016/04/04/opinion/international/jacob-zuma-must-go.html?_r=0

⁸ Discussion led by Prof Peter Alexander, UJ, on Marikana at seminar discussion at African Studies, St Antony’s College, Oxford University, October 2012. This interpretation of the unravelling of 1994 is further supported by Zuma’s recent appeal, after the Constitutional Court ruling on Nkandla (by 11 judges), for citizens in KwaZulu-Natal to vote for the ANC to get a two thirds majority in parliament in order to enable changes to aspects of the Constitution. Though he was referring here to delays in service delivery, this does signal a reluctant embrace of the 1996 Constitution within a faction within the current ANC leadership.

<http://citizen.co.za/158002/give-us-enough-votes-to-change-constitution-jz/> Analysts contend that President Zuma is not interested in upholding a ‘Western’ constitution and prefers the ‘traditional African’ way. <http://www.rdm.co.za/politics/2016/04/11/zuma-s-african-way-or-the-constitution--a-titanic-battle> (However it should also be noted that President Zuma has indicated a firm commitment to the Constitution previously some months ago in October 2015.) <http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-10-27/zuma-against-changing-south-africa-s-constitution-for-third-term>

The Economic Freedom Front (EFF) has led the campaign for constitutionality and has taken President Zuma to the Constitutional Court on the Nkandla matter (followed by the Democratic Alliance). The EFF has recently been the most vocal black political party voice on upholding the Constitution in South Africa. The veteran ANC

commentator Sampie Terreblanche⁹ and language scholar and former political prisoner the late Neville Alexander on this ‘unavoidable unravelling’¹⁰, given the magnitude of the sacrifices made by the majority in the negotiated settlement with regards to land and capital, may ring true for many. The entrenchment of certain powerful systemic aspects of apartheid is largely visible within the geographic¹¹ and economic spatiality of the new South Africa.¹²

It is the historic white university which provides perhaps most cogently, as an institution, a microscopic view of this ongoing spatial and situational injustice. The #RMF has brought much of this to light in very convincing ways and has effectively challenged the CODESA¹³ settlement and aspects of the 1996 Constitution and its

leadership (Kathrada and others) have added their voices strongly since the 31 March ruling.
<http://www.dailymaverick.co.za/opinionista/2016-04-12-zuma-and-the-constitutional-crisis/#.Vw51dNR97Mw>

⁹ See <http://mg.co.za/article/2012-08-03-00-rich-get-richer-through-unfettered-capitalism-not-own-devices>

¹⁰ See <https://www.marxists.org/archive/alexander/2006-racial-identity-citizenship-and-nation-building.pdf>. It should be noted that Terreblanche (who advocates a more ‘equal’ capitalist system than the creation of small black and big white elites) and Alexander (who advocated a non-racial socialist economic alternative) agreed on the symptoms of economic inequality in South Africa, but differed on the proposed solutions. It could be argued that it is within this ‘unravelling’, that the rural poor in South Africa may find comfort in traditional African leadership in the language of a leader who speaks the language of the promise of ‘service delivery’ and ‘job creation’ rather than of constitutionality (which is currently more a black urban rallying point). The economic unravelling for the rural poor (and even urban poor for that matter) could therefore precipitate the unintended political unravelling of constitutionality.
<http://www.bdlive.co.za/national/politics/2016/04/04/news-analysis-zuma-must-go-that-depends-where-you-live>

¹¹ For instance, land restitution in South Africa is a long and complex process for claimants. Many do not understand the process and information is not easily accessible except through civic pressure groups. In recognition of these constraints, the government has re-opened the process for lodging claims by extending the deadline to 30 June 2019 (original date was 31 December 1998). <http://www.gov.za/about-government/opening-lodgement-land-claims-campaign>. A further case in point is the impatience with the justice and restitution process for District Six ex-residents after 50 years of their historic and world known forced removal from the city to the Cape Flats. <http://www.vocfm.co.za/land-claim-delays-frustrating-claimants/>. See <http://www.timeslive.co.za/politics/2016/03/07/Analyst-warns-that-ANC-slowness-on-land-reform-puts-revolution-in-danger>

¹² For instance one tangible example is the fact that the 16 wealthiest people (billionaires) in South Africa, as ranked by Forbes in 2015, are 14 white males (the Oppenheims etc.) and 2 black males (Motsepe & Ramaphosa) See: <http://www.forbes.com/profile/patrice-motsepe/>

¹³ Convention for a Democratic South Africa held from December 1991 to 1993, a negotiation process between the ruling Nationalist Party and the ANC with other political parties in accordance to the National Peace Accord to find a peaceful and mutually agreed way to ‘end’ NP rule and to prepare for democratic elections. CODESA was boycotted by the Afrikaner right wing and leftist black organisations AZAPO and PAC (who saw the process as a ‘sell out’). (South Africa’s convention after the South African War was similarly a historic negotiation between Afrikaner and British economic and political powers, resulting in the Act of Union in 1910, followed shortly by the formation of the African National Congress in 1912 and the 1913 Land Act; the

associated laws (such as the resultant National Heritage Resources Act) to its core. The emerging militancy of the #RMF could be viewed as the beginnings of the 'inevitable' outcome which both the late Neville Alexander (of Cape Flats Ethiopian slave descent¹⁴ who read Fanon, Trotsky and Lenin amongst others) and Sampie Terreblanche¹⁵ (a white Afrikaner Stellenbosch University economist¹⁶) predicted. In their various analyses of what 'not listening', by both the old and new ruling parties, would result in, they did not look at Fanon to predict our new 'revolutionary' reality. Both scholars simply based their hypotheses on a very real observation and engagement with the significant compromises that were made in the CODESA years and in 1994 with regard to the material conditions and (what they saw as) the entrenchment of white capital control. Both provided very South African analyses and perspectives on a very South African reality, though not arguing for South African 'exceptionalism'¹⁷.

My point is that it is not a reading of Fanon that has precipitated our present revolutionary ethos at universities; it is a reading of a perceived reality expressed with references to the helpful readings of scholars like Fanon and Mamdani (as in the case of UCT) that has come to express these perspectives.

The revolutionary upheaval at universities in 2015 brought the ANC government to its knees within a couple of days and it had no option but to make concessions on meeting the demands of the students on the eve of the 40th anniversary of June 1976. ¹⁸Some scholars likened the event to South Africa's own 'Ten Days that Shook the World'. ¹⁹ By the end of 2015, these student protests had spread globally to major capitals in the world (London and New York). A recent phenomenon of anarchistic guerrilla-style hacking of university emails (even though denied by both UCT and

economic impact of this negotiation is still deeply entrenched in the South African landscape and economy today.)

¹⁴ See <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-14357121>

¹⁵ Author of 'History of Inequality in South Africa, 1652-2002'

¹⁶ See <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=IKclKzGBR1Q> ('Whites South Africans will have to make some sacrifices.')

¹⁷ Discourse critiqued by political scientist Mahmood Mamdani in 1998

¹⁸ I wrote a short note on same for the APC gazette of November 2015

¹⁹ Referring here to John Reed's book of 1919 on the Russian Revolution of October 1917. (Cynthia Kross on the removal of the statue of Rhodes at UCT)

#RMF)²⁰ indicates that the world of Edward Snowden²¹ and the creative power of anarchy as expressed in subversive social media power is much bigger in South Africa than imagined.

Recently, in the wake of the burning of UCT's artworks in February 2016 by #Shackville²² protestors (which unwittingly included Keresemose Baholo's anti-apartheid work titled 'Extinguished Torch of Academic Freedom', 1993), the petrol bombing of the Vice Chancellor's office and further militant protest actions around the accommodation crisis for black students²³, the university's Max Price responded to encourage the university community to 'keep the space open for debate and engagement – as imaginatively and courageously as possible'.²⁴ In response to these protests, Baholo is reported to have noted that UCT should 'anticipate'²⁵ not 'underestimate' how students feel about lack of transformation.²⁶

The APC has been trying to address the burning issues of transformation at UCT through such engagement, debate and to 'anticipate' over the past year since 16 March 2015 after the walkout of students and staff at a very unhappy meeting on heritage symbols on campus. The meeting was attended by the university community in its broadest sense of workers, students, academics and administrators. As the opening discussion of a then intended series of conversations which started with 'heritage, signage and symbolism', the walk-out by both staff and students was essentially about 'not being listened to'.

²⁰ See UCT email communication of February 2016 to staff and students

²¹ Information Access Activist who leaked thousands of classified American National Security Agency documents to promote new contemporary ways to address citizen rights, issues that affect the citizenry, and promote public awareness about privacy rights with regard to government control and surveillance, i.e. with the broad purpose 'to take back the internet'.

https://www.ted.com/talks/edward_snowden_here_s_how_we_take_back_the_internet?language=en

²² Named as such in protest of what is viewed as exclusion of poor black students from university accommodation. Protestors set up a shack on upper campus as a form of protest to draw attention to their plight.

²³ UCT has always been a predominantly white spatial site with black students (as inclusive of 'Indian' and 'Coloured') not being allowed to live in student residences during apartheid. The few black women, who were allowed entry to UCT on the permit system, had to live off campus such as at Baker House in Athlone, run by the Kadalie family. Black students were expected to make private arrangements for accommodation with families on the Cape Flats. UCT has transformed the student residence racial policy during the post-apartheid years, but it still seems haunted by perceived inequalities based on class and elitism.

²⁴ See UCT email sent out on 22 February 2016.

²⁵ Denoting a form of sensitive and insightful 'listening'.

²⁶ <http://citizen.co.za/998886/artist-still-sides-with-students-despite-burnt-painting/>

In the aftermath of this protest and in the midst of further national higher education protests in South Africa which erupted soon after, the dominant theme that emerged from the conversations at the October 2015 APC workshop was on the haunting presence of South Africa's ongoing 'woundedness'.²⁷ At this conversation, APC Honorary Research Fellow's and MISTRA's²⁸ Xolelwa Kashe-Katiya's paper led the dialogue on 'South Africa's Heritage of Woundedness'. As Kashe-Katiya put it, 'The events around the student protests offered a window to our woundedness. However, there is a need to understand the nature of this festering wound and also of continued "historical wound-making".'

The APC conversation took the theme of 'woundedness' and 'wound-making' further to the economically suggestive #FeesMustFall context of the issue of sacrifice, as a key element of the healing process and the different ways in which this can be viewed; viz a viz 'ancestral sacrifice of a beast', 'sacrifice of narratives of self-deception' and 'the sacrifice of collective illusions about our past and even our present', etc. We are reminded in these ongoing conversations that something is fundamentally wrong with how we relate to each other in the reality of the new South Africa, that there is a deep rootedness with our self-deception of where South Africa had 'arrived at' over 20 years after 1994.

It would be safe to say (given events on campuses since March 2015) that the 'rainbow nation' is in fact a false reality²⁹; we relate to each other with silent hostility, with a silent mutuality of unresolved and unspoken bitterness and even with grief and perhaps fear for what was 'lost' in the ambivalence of 1994 (which

²⁷ A theme that has admittedly become the subject of debate within global indigenous communities as the converse of resilience and agency. Woundedness is understood as linked to a post-colonial psychology, as a risk to creating safer and healthier communities. However, it can be argued that 'woundedness' has an inherent element of social agency and in fact takes us beyond what some critics would call 'victimhood discourse' which has re-emerged in post war Germany on the Holocaust (Germans as 'victims') and amongst whites in post-apartheid South Africa with regard to affirmative action. Victimhood discourse is viewed as a way of avoiding historical responsibility (Alon Confino, 'Remembering the Second World War, 1945 – 1965: Narratives of Victimhood and Genocide' in *Cultural Analysis* 4, 2005, University of California). The TRC is said to have contributed to discourse of victimhood in South Africa. (Michael Neocosmos, CODESRIA, 2006)

²⁸ Mapungubwe Institute for Strategic Reflection

²⁹ Much scholarship in South Africa since 1994 in the broad and inter-disciplinary fields of economics, health sciences, environment studies, heritage, law, city planning, anthropology, political science, sociology, education and history etc. has exactly been about showing this new reality.

was about symbiotic collective spiritual gain for economic sacrifice and loss in return).

Political party interference notwithstanding, the consequences of the economic sacrifices made in 1994 are still a lived reality for the majority of South Africans. For instance, a recent survey analysis by the Institute for Justice and Reconciliation (charged with the ongoing work of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission³⁰, TRC, with Tutu as patron) indicates a significant gravitation towards a workerist party³¹ as a new opposition to the liberal ANC³² - given the ongoing unresolved economic issues in the country. Unsurprisingly, memorialisation issues have become closely tied up with the economic issues of loss for the majority and gain for a small minority.

With economic injustice (housing, jobs, wages, the environment) go the usual trappings of spatial, education and cultural injustice (residential areas, language, curricula, access and black student retention levels at universities and schools, monuments etc.). For many young black South Africans, ubiquitous colonial monuments in urban centres have become troublesome symbols of the festering wounds of economic injustice and the still unresolved land question. They provide the spatial proximity for accessible physical attack unlike a complex historically deep and powerful economic system that is globally entrenched and inaccessible.

The Constitution (as a product of political negotiation) allows for co-existence of old and new economic power, for old and new heritage, for ambivalence that comes with political conventions; a quintessentially 'post-apartheid' South African situation. For much of the first twenty years after 1994, this ambivalence probably worked on the surface, though South Africa was overrun by strikes and protest

³⁰ Set up under Section 29 of the Promotion of National Unity and Reconciliation Act, 1995

³¹ Historians and scholars such as the late Martin Legassick and Wits History Workshop's Noor Nieftagodien have been active in recent years creating a subaltern political reality in close collaboration with workers' movements to address economic justice issues in a 'co-ordinated struggle' against poverty, inequality and racism. Such scholars contend that race and racism retain their deep relevance in discourse on South Africa's present. ('Martin Legassick: Messages of condolence, remembrance, solidarity', Memorial Service, St George's Cathedral, Cape Town, 12 March 2016)

³² See <http://www.ijr.org.za/>

action particularly after the first decade of 'freedom', until the shock of Marikana in 2012, Mandela's eventual long dying process in 2013³³ and an increasingly frail and aging Desmond Tutu who always reminded us to see the colours of the rainbow. But even Tutu has warned in recent years such as in August 2011 about the accumulation of wealth at the expense of a growing poor black class; that the rainbow nation was in fact under a formidable threat if there was not more acknowledgment of apartheid benefits and generous giving to create a more balanced society.³⁴ Tutu was speaking in the troublesome second decade after 'freedom' which has brought all the festering deep intergenerational wounds³⁵ (which could not be dealt with at the TRC 'hearings') to the surface. It was in this second decade (we have now entered the fateful third) that perceptions of 'not listening' increased and a new reality of economic injustice became a haunting presence for many.

In the first ten years of South Africa's democracy, there were visible national public campaigns for awareness of the Constitution and its Bill of Rights. This was also driven through the national Values in Education programme for schools³⁶ which dealt with constitutional responsibility and accountability and with 'listening and hearing' within a multilingual framework.

However, there is now a questioning by young black South Africans³⁷ of aspects of the Constitution of 1996 and the TRC as perhaps 'unjust'³⁸. In contemporary South

³³ There has been much speculation and rumour on the ground and in political circles that Mandela had died long before the public announcement due to safety and security concerns for South Africa. Whether this is true or not, it signals the precarious nature of South Africa's political stability in the popular imagination.

³⁴ See <http://www.sowetanlive.co.za/columnists/2011/08/18/wealth-tax-call-draws-mixed-reactions>

³⁵ Emerging scholarship in South Africa now looks at the exclusion of trauma since enslavement at the Cape, and the impact of displacement (through land dispossession and forced removals) from the social discourse on present South Africa. Though still relatively new in South Africa, recognition of this kind of trauma is already included in scholarship on the Holocaust, on the Aboriginal Australian experience, in New Zealand, Canada, on the Transatlantic Slave Trade etc. (See Shanaaz Hoosain's PhD thesis, UWC, 2013)

³⁶ See Manifesto on Values, Education and Democracy, Ministry of Education, Pretoria, RSA, 2001. <http://www.education.gov.za/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=tYzHKQLJJE%3D&tabid=129&mid=425>

³⁷ Though the EFF has used the Constitution against President Zuma on the Nkandla matter, they have campaigned to revoke the property clauses in the Constitution to address 'poverty and inequality' in late 2015. <http://www.biznews.com/transformation/2015/10/30/effs-dali-mpofu-changing-the-constitution-tackling-inequality-poverty/>

³⁸ See for instance 'The TRC and CODESA failed South Africa: It's time we reflected on this.' Frank Meintjies, 12 September 2013, (The South African Civil Service Information Service)

Africa, charitable organisations such as the Nelson Mandela Foundation seem to be taking on this national responsibility.³⁹ Incidentally, the Foundation has also recently called for an urgent meeting with the ruling ANC to discuss the constitutional crisis and the deep-rooted systemic problems in the country that 'need to receive sustained public attention'.⁴⁰

We are quickly learning to live with a profound presence of haunting in South Africa (and questioning of our individual and institutional responsibilities in this regard) as events erupt around memory of the ultimate sacrifice made by many and of offending monuments in the landscape. In addition, protests are moving at high speed towards tackling unresolved economic and land claim issues. For instance, Richard Pakleppa, a film documentary maker on 'Paths to Freedom' which tells the story of Namibian freedom fighters, through use of oral history and archival sources, shared reflections at the October APC workshop on the notion of 'haunting' through spirit mediums such as of the young Cape Flats ANC activist, Colleen Williams, who was killed by the apartheid government in Athlone in the 1980s by a booby-trapped bomb. As the ruling party continues to be perceived as failing the people of South Africa, there is also the resurfacing of memories of the ultimate price paid by lesser known activists like Dulcie September⁴¹ and others (public discourse is no longer only confined to the dominant public narrative of the ANC such as of Ruth First and others). Furthermore, in early 2015 some 147 transcripts of confidential TRC hearings were handed to the South African History Archives that could reveal 'truths'⁴² on apartheid's Civil Co-operation Bureau's slash fund that was used for the murder of Dulcie September and others. Recently, the family of murdered ANC Cape Flats activist Ashley Kriel (killed in 1987) reopened his murder investigations with the

³⁹ See <https://www.nelsonmandela.org/news/entry/my-constitution-exhibition-giving-a-voice-to-young-South-Africans>

⁴⁰ <http://www.bdlive.co.za/national/2016/04/09/mandela-foundation-seeks-meeting-with-anc>

⁴¹ Dulcie September is a former 'Coloured' teacher from Athlone on the Cape Flats who was assassinated in 1988 in Paris where she was chief representative for the ANC. Following her death, 60 000 people marched through Paris in protest. However, no one has ever been charged with her murder. In 2015 a play written by Sylvia Vollenhoven and Basil Appollis, called 'Cold Case' was staged at the Baxter theatre to revisit her death and memory.

⁴² See Zenzile Khoisan, 'TRC files reveal damning truth', 12 April 2015

help of a private forensic expert. It has now been shown that his death was not 'a mistake' as told by Benzien to the TRC, but a murder.⁴³

Sentiments of 'haunting' are not only expressed amongst young militant South Africans, but also by the older anti-apartheid activist generation such as Robben Island ex-political prisoners who are now tour guides on the Island. They speak 'off the record' of homelessness, unemployment, being 'forgotten' for sacrifices they have made. Similar sentiments are expressed on the Cape Flats by those who were injured in the Trojan Horse incident in Athlone in 1985. Such activists have aligned themselves with the Khoisan Revivalist Movement for social justice⁴⁴.

Like all historically white higher education institutions, it goes without saying that UCT, in spite of its conscious renaming of spaces and continuing efforts in this regard⁴⁵, remains a haunted space of the lingering memories of those who experienced intergenerational psychological⁴⁶ and economic violence (the often quoted Mafeje affair⁴⁷, the untold experience of the permit system for black students under apartheid⁴⁸, the current charges of institutional racism⁴⁹ by #RMF, black academic⁵⁰ and professional staff etc.).

⁴³ <http://www.iol.co.za/news/crime-courts/support-for-ashley-kriel-petition-1995484>

⁴⁴ See J.Bam 'Contemporary Khoisan identities in the Western Cape and campaigns for social justice', in Bulletin of the National Library of South Africa, Vol. 69. Nr 2, December 2015

⁴⁵ Such as renaming the old Chemical Engineering Building the Khoi name 'Hoerikwaggo' in 2005; Neville Alexander Building; A C Jordan Building; Cissie Gool Plaza; Archie Mafeje Room etc. There are currently public calls to rename Jameson Hall etc. within evidently pressing and urgent deadlines. <http://www.bdlive.co.za/national/education/2016/03/30/uct-asks-for-suggestions-on-new-names-for-landmark-buildings>

⁴⁶ See for instance http://www.scielo.org.za/scielo.php?script=sci_arttext&pid=S0256-95742012000600081 on the experience of race discrimination at UCT Medical School between 1945 and 1994 such as that until 1985 black students were requested to excuse themselves from classes where white patients (including white dead bodies) were present. This published research paper also makes the point that UCT applied its own institutional racism practices long before apartheid was imposed as policy in 1948, such as Council barred black students from studying at UCT, and when they were eventually permitted to the university, they were barred from socially mixing with white students in sport and other activities. Tutorial groups were racially segregated and senior faculty members reminded black students to be 'grateful'. The article notes that UCT only admitted its first black African medical student in 1985.

⁴⁷ Based on the 1968 saga over the appointment of much respected black scholar Archie Mafeje as senior lecturer in Social Anthropology which was halted by the apartheid state and which led to campus protests. Mafeje applied for a chair position at UCT in the new South Africa in 1994, but was still not successful.

⁴⁸ These student experiences at UCT have not yet been documented through oral histories. The permit system was introduced between 1959 and 1985 as part of apartheid education policy. From 1983 (at the time of the Tri-cameral Parliament) the University Amendment Act introduced the quota system to replace the permit system. Up until 1983, it was a criminal offence for a black student to register at a formerly open university without special permission from government. A person who was not white had to apply to the apartheid

Speaking of intergenerational violence and exclusionary practices, it is currently not yet a much acknowledged aspect of public discourse apart from its very powerful place in the speech of UCT SRC President Ramabina Mahapa on 16 March 2015 at the beginning of the now powerful national youth protest movement - that is that UCT occupies the land of the ancient Khoi. This calls upon us as 'deeper thinking' scholars to intervene ethically and accordingly - not only ceremoniously - but also in our individual actions as those who do control some sort of power within the system. At the time of making that speech, Mahapa asked critical questions then about former President Mbeki's speech on behalf of the African National Congress at the adoption of the Constitution of South Africa on 8 May 1996, 'I am an African'. He quoted Mbeki on the 'desolate souls who haunt the great expanses of the beautiful Cape; they who fell victim to the most merciless genocide our native land has ever seen, they who were the first to lose their lives in the struggle to defend our freedom and dependence and they who, as a people, perished in the result.'⁵¹ Mahapa reminded us then that Mbeki's speech was essentially about *haunting*, and was a call for 'listening' to the narrative of a much silenced genocide and earliest freedom struggle that often and too easily loses its place in the post-apartheid grand narrative of South Africa's history.

Perceptions of black nationalist chauvinism at the expense of acknowledgment of the Khoi's ancient presence and struggles against European colonialism in southern

Minister of Education to study at an English white university such as UCT. The permit required application on the basis that the university for the designated 'tribe' of the student did not offer the course that the black student (black African, 'Coloured' and 'Indian') desired to study. Popular choices at UCT to gain entry into Humanities were CAGL (Comparative African Government and Law) and Archaeology. It was harder to get into the sciences and medicine if you were black. In the exclusive Medical Faculty the experience for black students was particularly alienating (as has been documented).

⁴⁹ See Chapter 2 Section 9 of the Constitution, 1996

⁵⁰ Leading public voices on continued institutional racism at UCT include those of Siona O'Connell and Xolela Mangcu. See <http://mg.co.za/article/2014-09-08-uct-a-campus-at-odds-with-itself>. O'Connell reported to have received 800 hate emails (suspected to be also from white colleagues) after her article in the newspaper on racism at UCT. <http://www.iol.co.za/capeargus/what-ucts-not-telling-their-first-years-1806441>
<http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/western-cape/uct-lecturer-ostracised-after-column-1824551>
<http://www.universityworldnews.com/article.php?story=20150402171658897>

⁵¹ See UCT News 16 March 2015 & <http://www.anc.org.za/show.php?id=4322>

Africa are widely expressed in everyday conversation (especially in the Cape) and are informed by notions that such an acknowledgment is feared as it may give rise to profound questions on the unresolved and burning land question for the indigenous people of the Cape – an issue the late Neville Alexander consistently warned about in his many public talks since his return from Robben Island in the late 1970s⁵².

Research on the genocide of the Khoi people is privately conducted by scholars in the safety of journals and academic papers or books, while it has become one of the strongest organising themes in public Khoisan Revivalist awareness activism for social justice. This tension needs resolution in taking debates further in accessible form and in attaining social and economic justice for the self-identified Khoi people. The known atrocities (in journals and peer refereed publications) need to be opened up for public awareness, acknowledgment and discussion. They need to be ‘heard’ and witnessed through the voice of the Khoi-descendent people. South Africa has to pause and ‘listen’ in a new way.⁵³ Recent public hearings of the marginalisation and genocide of the Khoi were held in November 2015 as part of human rights activism on the basis of complaints received by South Africa’s Human Rights Commission regarding access to basic services, land etc. ⁵⁴Over twenty years later, we are only at the beginning of listening.

Khoisan Revivalist activists draw parallels with the plight of the Native Americans, the Aboriginal Australians and the Maoris in New Zealand.⁵⁵ In South Africa, academic debates are in another sphere; about the complexity of identity and ethnicity and though they have theoretical validity, they may have the unintended outcome of confounding and delaying the campaign for economic justice for evidently poor and dispossessed communities⁵⁶. By actually listening to the counter narratives of the dispossessed, we may learn something new such as that their own

⁵² The author was mentored by Alexander in the civic movement on his release from Robben Island in the late 1970s on the Cape Flats.

⁵³ Chapter 2 Section 9 of the Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996 pertains to these rights.

⁵⁴ See <http://www.vocfm.co.za/our-human-rights-are-violated-khoi-and-san-chair/>

⁵⁵ The author is a researcher in this area of social activism.

⁵⁶ My argument is that ‘Khoi’ heritage activism is a collective to organise for historical social justice rather than the voice of ‘an ethnically defined’ group.

identities are diverse, that there is in fact an awareness of construct of identity and chiefs, that people are more integrated with the Khoi than acknowledged. Such 'new' listening could empower an innovative strategic approach to the current delays with effectively addressing crucial and fundamental economic and social justice issues. We can only do this through changing and opening up our scholarship practices. Does participative research mean *actual listening*, for instance? And what does it mean to really *listen to open up to approaches to scholarship and ways of knowing different to our own*? What is this *new listening* that requires us to go beyond the limitations of 1980s voice discourse in South Africa, for instance?

UCT will no doubt not escape the impact of the groundswell of the worldwide indigenous rights movement and the 'woundedness' currently expressed by the diverse descendants of the Khoi on the land they once occupied. The notion of UCT as the 'gift of Rhodes' which emerged in public debates on social media during 2015 is rightly perceived as a form of deep violence and an entrenchment of the disavow of the ancient⁵⁷ Khoi people and their centuries of occupation of southern Africa⁵⁸. It is therefore no surprise that UCT, in particular, as much traumatised intergenerational space, has become the target for catalytic revolutionary national events in the new South Africa, with students from the Faculty of Humanities being at the forefront in their scholarly citing of the writings of Fanon and others.

Some indigenous spiritualists may argue that UCT will never rest as it is 'haunted' in its occupation of Khoi land - without public acknowledgment - a space where human rights atrocities (through exclusion and discrimination) were committed during the consecutive decades of segregation and apartheid. It is therefore a site that calls for spiritual healing and ever-present ongoing cleansing ceremonies in its various spaces to heal from intergenerational woundedness. Some people would express that they felt this cathartic healing deep from within when they witnessed

⁵⁷ Denoting here, not a tribal timelessness but an ancient occupation of the land as with the Aboriginal peoples of Australia etc.

⁵⁸ Evidence of Khoi occupation can be found as far north as Ethiopia. Neville Alexander is himself of Ethiopian descent.

how the crane eventually lifted the Rhodes statue on 9 April 2015. For days preceding this eventual burial of one of the many ghosts of Rhodes⁵⁹, UCT became a ceremonial space for mutual mourning theatre⁶⁰ of notions of intergenerational losses suffered through 'dispossession' of all sorts in the South African landscape.

Covered with a white cloth (at such occasion, the death ritual around the Rhodes statue looked like a preparation for a Janazah⁶¹); a red cloth (which in Chinese burial custom would have denoted the fearsome return of the 'ghost' of Rhodes after burial); unceremoniously tied bulging black refuse bags (such as when a body is recovered following a tragedy) - Rhodes' eyes were then chaotically spray-painted a bright orange. The burial 'shrouds' were removed (moving the statue from the 'deceased' state) to a state of 'live' imprisonment as the statue sat eerily in a boxed wooden case like a prisoner for a day or two; its wanting historic gaze to the East towards Cairo effectively barred. When the statue was finally removed, a group of black male students whipped the face of Rhodes repeatedly as they accompanied 'the corpse' on the removal van ('hearse') to a consigned 'resting place' and archive. After the removal, a wreath was placed by some unknown person at the site of 'burial' and an unknown artist spray-painted the ghost of Rhodes as a long black shadow on the steps of the site. Where Rhodes once sat, are a grey painted wooden box and his haunting large black shadow. These ghostly things are all that are allowed to remain.

Notwithstanding the complexities involved in memorialisation and monuments, the argument for retention of history and heritage and the legal and democratic

⁵⁹ A quick search for 'Rhodes' in Google reveals how deeply inscribed his legacy is on street maps, the hospitality industry, education institutions etc. UCT Upper Campus is located under the nose of the imposing Rhodes Memorial of Cecil John Rhodes on horseback, looking out from Cape to Cairo, flanked by majestic lions. After the removal of the Rhodes statue in April, the Rhodes memorial has been 'attacked' in September 2015, with Rhodes' nose cut off and being re-curated with graffiti calling him a 'racist, thief and murderer'. See <http://www.iol.co.za/news/crime-courts/mystery-of-rhodes-missing-nose-1918649#.VgAZRhGqpBc>.

⁶⁰ Though black and white students were doing this largely in solidarity at the time, the resistance theatre that was played out was visibly by racially polarised black and white citizens (from 'outside' the university) who assertively occupied the performance space.

⁶¹ Muslim burial

imperatives concerned⁶², this moment of the 'burial' of the UCT Rhodes statue was for many - as witnessed by a slowly setting sun behind our ancient Hoerikwaggo ('Mountain of the Sea') - catalytic, cathartic and hugely historic with sighs and vibrations felt right in the heart of London thousands of miles across the ocean.⁶³

Hoerikwaggo is a mountain that has witnessed and endured ancient fires and burials. In a discussion of social and economic relations in the former slave colony, Robert Shell writes in 'Children of Bondage' (1994) of the slave revolt of 1688 in Cape Town which was led by a free black person Sante van Sante Jago of Cape Verde and an enslaved person, Michiel⁶⁴, with the ambition 'to burn down house after house to ashes'. Stellenbosch as site of enslavement and revolt (also not yet publically acknowledged) burned down in 1710. ⁶⁵There was always a huge fear of fire at the Cape, not only because of the havoc it causes to the dwellings of the poor inflicted by the notorious 'Black South Easter'⁶⁶ but also because it was the form in which revolt against the slave system was expressed, making use of the destructive power of high winds at the Cape of Storms.⁶⁷ Arson (and even mere attempts to commit arson) in the Cape slave colony was brutally punished with acts such as being 'roasted alive', being impaled and broken on the wheel. ⁶⁸

UCT occupies an integral place in this historic Hoerikwaggo landscape in its geographic proximity to the Cape of Good Hope Castle (where Lady Ann Barnard

⁶² For instance, ANC stalwart Albie Sachs visited the Rhodes statue site at UCT in March 2016 before its removal to argue for keeping Rhodes 'alive' to 'force him' to witness our constitutional democracy. <http://www.uct.ac.za/dailynews/?id=9064>. It seems the 'rational' and 'reasoned' voice of the ANC veterans (as was the case a decade ago when constitutionality was much 'listened to' ANC public discourse) is no longer finding favour with an ever growing impatient black youth movement (with the recent exception of the EFF).

⁶³ See <http://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-32236922>

⁶⁴ It is now common knowledge that most enslaved people at the Cape lost their names or had new names given to them - simply forenames such as adjectives or nouns, calendar names (January, October etc.), classical names (Cupido etc.), Old Testament names (Solomon and Moses), to dehumanise and demean. (See Robert Shell, *Children of Bondage*, Witwatersrand University Press, 1994, p.240 – 246). The UCT staff list (including of its general workers) would expectedly reveal this strong legacy in its lower paid 'outsourced' and internal workforce.

⁶⁵ See Robert Shell, *Children of Bondage*, Witwatersrand University Press, 1994, p.264

⁶⁶ Also associated with floods and storms at the Cape

⁶⁷ Hence reason for the urban design of canals in the city (Heerengracht and Kaizergracht)

⁶⁸ Some would argue that such were the punishments in Europe at the time, and that the Cape (as a colony) was therefore no exception.

rather than sis'Krotoa⁶⁹ is celebrated), the Prestwich Memorial (where we drink 'Truth' coffee with our backs turned to the ossuary holding the human remains of some 2500 people of the Cape poor and the formerly enslaved in little archaeology brown boxes), and the notorious Gallows Hill (where the 'underclasses' were amongst those hanged; now the ironic name of a 'My City' bus stop opposite the Green Point Traffic Department). UCT is also part of the mountain landscape of Van Riebeeck's first hedge of segregation in Kirstenbosch⁷⁰. The Cape of Good Hope Castle with its 'beastly' founding date of 1666⁷¹ is known for its much feared Donker gat or 'Dark Hole'⁷² and torture chamber as part of the incarceration of those found guilty of acts of resistance.

My point is that we live and work in the intimacy of the university's Hoerikwaggo space with the presence of the little acknowledged trauma of *uninterrupted* waves of physiological, spiritual and psychological wounds from the 1650s. These include the decades of land dispossession and migrant labour: the 1913 Land Act, segregationist policies, 1948 and the diverse crimes against humanity that followed through the various apartheid legislations. The popular perception is that 1994 did not bring the much anticipated relief to the majority in this historic making of this 'ongoing and deep woundedness'.

⁶⁹ 'Sis' denoting respect

⁷⁰ Van Riebeeck planted a hedge in 1660 with indigenous wild almonds in the path of Khoi grazing land (which led to further Dutch-Khoi conflict) as the first 'border' between the Dutch East India Company settlement and the Khoi. Remnants of this hedge still remain in Kirstenbosch Gardens down the road from UCT. Furthermore, black people who lived in the Hoerikwaggo space of Kirstenbosch and the surrounding areas of Newlands, Bishops Court (Protea Village) and Constantia also suffered forced removals under apartheid with families forced to the outlying impoverished Cape Flats areas such as Grassy Park, Steenberg and Mitchells Plain. <http://www.iol.co.za/news/south-africa/settlement-for-kirstenbosch-removals-86075>

⁷¹ The numerical symbol in '666' is seen by some Khoi activists as denoting ongoing economic evil and political conspiracy at the Cape and a sign of freemasonry; a probable interpretation of 'the beast' in the New Testament or of the 'Antichrist'.

⁷² It has been observed with discomfort by University of Stanford Site of Memory students of 2016 that the Military Museum shop at the Castle sells novelties for children making light of the 'spooky' spaces of incarceration (such as 'the Dark Hole', claimed by Khoisan Revivalist activists as a 'trauma' site). The Cape of Good Hope Castle management acknowledged the trouble of the continued scripted telling of a 'sanitised' version of the space in an address to the Minister of Defence in December 2015 in preparation for its 350 year commemoration. See <http://www.vocfm.co.za/castle-of-good-hope-marks-350-years/>

Much of the space that UCT occupies is now slowly being questioned, claimed, occupied and appropriate intellectual intervention is required through *new listening*. For some, it is the space of the burial ground of former Khoi and enslaved people whose descendants (as university workers, students and staff) may feel that they are still perhaps 'barred from mourning'⁷³, using here the expression chosen by Memory Biwa in a discussion of the ossuary at Prestwich Memorial.⁷⁴ It is a space in which the dispossessed Khoi people see themselves disavowed, dispossessed, 'peripherised', 'minoritised', and made 'invisible'.⁷⁵ In the diversity in which enslaved people at the Cape from elsewhere in Africa, the East and indigenous people became entangled; some as 'Coloured'⁷⁶ and some as 'African' under apartheid's random racial classification, they are the people who clean our offices and toilets, the many invisible administrators, those who tend to our gardens, the maintenance workers, the builders - often the poorer student from Langa, Mitchells Plain - the people many academic staff members at UCT are said to easily ignore in the corridors and perhaps hardly greet.⁷⁷ This invisible group includes the activist scholar who has, through every day and determined resistance agency, survived the psychological trauma of the apartheid experience at UCT, who has fought to overthrow an unjust racist system and who may be occupying the office next door. They are the ones sometimes referred to as 'not quite the right fit' because they are intellectually disruptive; they haunt white scholarship and fragility.

In my own scholarship, I am about disruption. So I have chosen to present this seminar with Bradley van Sitters today⁷⁸, a leading figure in the Khoisan Revivalist

⁷³ There may be a need for spiritual ritual, cleansing and mourning. <http://www.uct.ac.za/dailynews/?id=8921>

⁷⁴ In citing scholars on memorialisation of human remains

⁷⁵ Using here the terms often used by anthropologist Harrison in her discourse

⁷⁶ Which from various local family narratives of 'origins' at the Cape, also include the randomised poor from Europe who came to settle at the Cape. An example, is a narrative shared recently with Stanford University Sites of Memory class in February 2016 of diverse family origins narrated by District Six ex-residents at the District Six Museum .

⁷⁷ Much of these assertions emerged last year in the public discussions and imbizos on transformation at UCT

⁷⁸ Unfortunately, Bradley van Sitters could not make the actual presentation of this paper as he was caught up at a conference at the Castle of Good Hope which he occupies as a Khoisan Revivalist activist. The intention was for van Sitters to open the seminar with a Khoi prayer and the burning of mphepo as a cleansing of the 'space' to allow an 'opening up' of suppressed voices on unexpressed anger, bitterness, fear, feelings of alienation and discrimination etc. and to facilitate new forms of 'listening' in scholarship discourse.

Movement and an activist scholar who works alongside Catherine Odora-Hoppers who holds the NRF Chair in Development Education at Unisa. Bradley is my equal voice, and at times my conscience. We come from the same area on the Cape Flats near present day Vrygrond⁷⁹ (meaning 'Free Land') which is part of present day Lavender Hill⁸⁰, near Muizenberg beach where my late mom took me for long walks in the veld to pass on her Khoi knowledge. Bradley, like me, carries a strong Khoisan self-identity through our maternal ancestry and we see our scholarship as part of our activism for social justice. Bradley's work is part of the intellectual and heritage 'occupy movement' at Parliament (for the Khoisan to be heard in the new South Africa), at the Castle of Good Hope (to teach Khoi languages and to provide a counter narrative on haunting and torture in a much sanitised 'Lady Anne Barnard' space), in Mosselbay (to problematize the 1488 Dias paradigm of 'Discovery' of southern Africa, perceived by local activists as the place where the first European atrocity of 'spilling indigenous blood' was committed) and in Swellendam (where there is current uproar about an insensitively named 'Whipping Post' restaurant on a former slave and Khoi site as part of the Drosdy Museum Complex). The Board of this museum drew attention in the media in November 2015 for possible criminal charges for ignoring heritage legislation by authorising the building of a pizza oven under a thatched roof in the area of where enslaved people were whipped. The action of eating in a place of trauma and incarceration was also challenged, along with the inappropriate and insensitive naming of the museum as 'The Whipping Post'.⁸¹ In recent conversation with EPWP⁸² staff on the site, the narrative is told that

⁷⁹ A place called Rondevlei. This is where my family settled as a consequence of the forced removals from Simonstown in the 1960s.

⁸⁰ Created by the apartheid regime to resettle residents forcibly removed from District Six and other areas around Hoerikwaggo. As a child in the late 1960s, I recall watching the non-stop working yellow tractors clear sand dunes nearby our home on Saturdays and Sundays to make way for the erection of sub-economic flats for the displaced people of the forced removals. The tractors worked noisily throughout the night to resettle long lists of hundreds of displaced people. After moving from Simonstown which was declared white, my family had to move again in 1976 to make way for the City Council's Prince George Drive 'highway' that was planned to separate the newly created 'Coloured' Lavender Hill from adjacent white Zeekoevlei where UCT's world famous cardiologist Chris Barnard lived. Though we had to move, this 'planned' highway was never built.

⁸¹ See <http://www.iol.co.za/news/politics/welcome-to-the-whipping-post-have-a-seat-1951947>

⁸² Extended Public Works Programme

a group led by civic activist Mario Wanza⁸³ threatened to burn the museum complex down if they are not heard on (what is popularly perceived as) 'cannibalism' in Khoi trauma spaces of memory.⁸⁴ The story goes that the local people descendent of the Khoi are constantly ignored by municipal authorities and not 'heard' - hence the threat of arson. The restaurant has since been renamed as 'The Trading Post' though the activity of eating still continues.

This notion of 'not listening' and not being 'heard' (in the colonial and present context) undoubtedly goes back a long time, as long as the acts of arson, and is an identifiable thread running through South Africa's history as evident in (amongst others) the vast colonial archive, the Rivonia Trial, the Truth and Reconciliation Commission, Mbeki's Aids denial, Marikana and the present resistance within the ruling party⁸⁵ regarding the constitutional ruling by 11 of the country's judges on Nkandla.

One of the widely recognised limitations of the TRC, though recognising its important historical function at the time for stability and peaceful racial co-existence in South Africa, is that (because of its legal mandate with regards to 'gross human violations from 1960'), the majority of the intergenerational wounded was not 'heard' at the TRC 'hearings'.⁸⁶

As we all know, listening is a sacred human value, which we do not only do with our ears and our eyes⁸⁷. We also communicate it in our body gestures and in our own silent responses or actions of inclusion and their converse actions of exclusion from physical and virtual spaces, from excluding others from professional power networks and elitist social gatherings and caucuses.

⁸³ Wanza is a well known civic and poo activist who has campaigned for housing and municipal services. He is also known for having relaunched the UDF in recent years.

⁸⁴ Based on a conversation with EPWP staff at Swellendam Drosdy Museum on 21 February 2016

⁸⁵ <http://mg.co.za/article/2016-04-13-ancwl-reiterates-support-for-president-zuma/>

⁸⁶ As a response to this shortcoming, the Apartheid Archive Project was established as an international project in South Africa to provide access to 5000 personal or narrative accounts of the apartheid experience. Conferences were held between 2009 and 2014. Researchers include Pumla Gobodo-Madikizela, author of 'A Human Being died that Night' and poet and author Gabeba Baderoon.

⁸⁷ Not denoting exclusion of the visually or hearing impaired as 'listening' is not only physiological.

In this long reading on 'listening' on Hoerikwaggo, allow me now to share with you my first awakening of the 'explicit awareness' of listening which came from my late mother in her last conversation with me a fortnight before she passed on. When I asked her on this sad occasion of permanent earthly parting if there was anything she wanted to tell me before passing on into that 'good night'⁸⁸, her response was that there was 'ancient wisdom' to share with me; that though I'm a scholar I lacked the basic literacy of actual *listening*. In her rage of losing her earthly being, she urged me that real wisdom lies in listening, *careful* listening, *respectful* listening in a form of mutuality that sustains our humanity. She urged that if I want to really truly teach and learn in this world, I should practice 'genuine listening'. This was a mother who took us into the veld for long walks every Sunday afternoon to teach us about Khoisan plants and herbs; how to dig out roots, what was edible in the veld, what was medicinal. After a long walk through the veld towards Zeekoeivlei (because we could not go to the nearby forbidden whites-only beach of Muizenberg), we would pause to rest on the top of a high sand dune to eat our freshly gathered plant roots and berries. With our mother we looked out towards 'Table Mountain', towards UCT, which featured as a small reddish spot on Hoerikwaggo in the distance. As a child, growing up under apartheid, attending the Cape Flats Distress Association primary school⁸⁹ in Retreat at the time, this *distance* was real in many ways. It was where white people lived, socialised and achieved. Hoerikwaggo became the exclusive space for white madams and bosses. *It was not for us*. My Khoi world around the wetlands on the Cape Flats was another much deprived reality, though an earthly and universally connected one to Hoerikwaggo. On the Friday afternoon of her passing in that Spring, when the Cape *vygies* were in full bloom on those same white sand dunes, my mother took me by my hand on a long 'walk' back into my childhood, into the veld amongst the sand dunes to listen to the buzzing sound of

⁸⁸ An adapted interpretation of Dylan Thomas' 'Do not go gentle into that good night'

⁸⁹ The Cape Flats Distress Association was founded in 1942 as a commission on poverty and homelessness on the Cape Flats. A housing estate was created in the mid-1940s for poor 'Coloured' people on the Cape Flats. With the forced removals under the apartheid regime, it also resettled people forcibly removed from Harfield Village, Claremont, Newlands, District Six etc. The school was established during the apartheid years. (Now renamed as Cafda Development Association.)

the now vanishing bees, to listen to the quack of the pelicans flying with their long yellow beaks across the vast blue open sky in the direction of the unreachable red spot on Hoerikwaggo. We listened to the splashing of the bathing pink flamingos in the nearby vlei, watched the tortoises cautiously crawling home under the fynbos, and smelled the comforting herbal fragrances of the crushed fynbos leaves that we rubbed between our hands. That afternoon shortly after four in the afternoon, my mother's last breath raged and she urged me to *listen* and to *remember*.⁹⁰ As she passed on for her bones to become yet again part of the Cape's Khoi earth, I counted her final seven breaths and listened.

I remembered then how my mother confessed to me in the late 90s with the first international Khoisan conference in Cape Town that she could speak the Khoi language and knew the clicks, but like her ancestors she silenced her own tongue as not to be 'heard' to be a 'native' and therefore deemed as 'subhuman' in segregationist and apartheid Cape Town. That afternoon, I learnt the true meaning of listening from the last desperate seven breaths of my late mom when she passed on into that 'good night' with her head resting on my breasts. Her ancestral rage of seven long breaths and the rupture in her throat⁹¹ reminded me of her long silenced Khoi tongue; her last breath painfully final, soft and lingering into the Cape winds of the present here at Hoerikwaggo.

When I returned to London⁹², after putting her to rest in the white sand of the Cape dunes covered with colourful early Spring *vygies*, I was welcomed back by the visiting Khoisan of the Kimberley-based San Institute of South Africa (we were working together on a *Lalela* convocation as part of the South African Landscape at the British Museum). They made me a necklace of ostrich beads with a triangle as a telepathy totem to communicate with the spirit of my late mother. I was instructed

⁹⁰ My mother is from the Griqua Movement, of which her grandfather was national secretary. She related stories of playing as a child in Hankey (where Sarah Baartman is buried) as they travelled from town to town to sing and pray for the return of the land to the Khoi people.

⁹¹ Referring here to a Credo Mutwa expression

⁹² Where I lived at the time.

to use the necklace to 'hear her voice' in the wind and to 'learn the important lesson of listening'.

I know that my experience of death and dying is not unique (thank you for listening); it is part of the human experience – we all have our own intimate stories and encounters of a loved one's soul's passing. Some of us already know the pain of losing a mother. But I choose to speak about death of a loved one, because academics and scholars are humans forced into a clinical, sterile, vicious, mercenary and competitive system. To survive, we often forget our own humanity in the epistemically violent system. Higher education institutions operate as Western colonial scientific 'beasts' regulated as part of historic 'industrialisation' for 'scientific output'. In competing for its own global space as a fellow 'beast', UCT has come to exist as a space of both life and death⁹³; of both visibilities and invisibilities; of both subversive power⁹⁴ and oppression⁹⁵.

After a long longing to belong in the ancient Khoi landscape of Hoerikwaggo, I fulfilled a maternal ancestral wish to gain entry to UCT as an undergraduate in the early 80s (though on a special apartheid permit from Pretoria). I was here for a long time, including in this building where I trained as a school teacher as part of my post-graduate studies in 1984. (Incidentally, it was the late Neville Alexander who as one of my mentors wrote me my first recommendation to be employed as a teacher on the Cape Flats.) I went on to do further degrees in education here and in that long journey swallowed countless moments of humiliation as many of us did of that generation of oppressed South Africans. Like many, I survived UCT which we turned into a space of resistance using the toilets in the Beattie Building to distribute our anti-apartheid pamphlets.

⁹³ Referring here to much needed medical research to sustain life (UCT is internationally recognised in health sciences research on tuberculosis etc.); yet 'social and economic death' that can result from exclusion or low success rates for the poor and marginalised.

⁹⁴ Certain academic courses and teaching have groomed many a leftist activist and continue to do so in the present.

⁹⁵ As evident in student narratives of experiences, statements by the Black Academic Caucus, public transformation dialogues, and PASS staff Imbizos over the past year.

Given the nature of the public explosions on campus over the past year, it is clear that historically white universities in South Africa have no option but to try to move out of their 'spaces'; they have to become listening spaces, soft spaces, boundary-less spaces, *Lalela* spaces, places of 'ritualistic cleansing' and healing of intergenerational trauma and of the space therefore perceived as perpetuating 'ongoing evil'. I was first introduced to the concept of '*Lalela*' by Zulu-speaker Eugene Skeef, a confidante of the late Steve Biko who lived in exile in London during apartheid⁹⁶. I met Eugene at the huge engulfing and towering doors of the British Museum in 2010. Eugene had boycotted the very colonial British Museum until then. We agreed to work together on the South African Landscape project. This was a 'visibility intervention', using the senses of listening and touching in getting visitors to explore the landscape and to have new conversations. Skeef explained in follow up workshops with South Africans that *Lalela* requires a 'convocation' of 'deep listening'.

In terms of the notion of *Lalela* and 'deep listening', there are perceptions that ancestral anger requires 'the beast' to be sacrificed for the intergenerational wounds to heal. What is this 'beast'? What historical and contemporary form does it take at a historically white university like UCT? How does it mutate, evolve? ⁹⁷What do we need to sacrifice in order to heal in this space? What strategies can be employed to do this necessary and unavoidable 'sacrifice', to turn it into a creative intellectual energy that transforms our sense of knowledge and scholarship?

At the Cape of Good Hope Castle, the Khoisan Revivalist Movement activists sacrifice 'the beast' through occupation and a counter narrative *within* the space, by ritualistic chanting for naming the torture, incarceration and execution spaces for what they are, by counter curating the castle as a site of memory, by burning mphepo, and by teaching the Khoi language. The Cape of Good Hope Castle is, like

⁹⁶ Skeef works internationally in the area of healing and trauma in 'post-conflict' societies.

⁹⁷ Acknowledging here contributions made by Francis Nyamnjoh in response to this paper at the Anthropology Seminar of 1 March 2016 on notions of 'the beast' at UCT.

UCT, a haunted space where restless ‘ghosts’ are ‘sighted’.⁹⁸ In the early 80s a small group of black activist students, studying on permits under apartheid at UCT, gathered regularly in a small tutorial room in the Leslie Sciences building for séances to call up the spirits that wandered its landscape, to find sanity in the painful encounters of racism that were prevailing in the intimacy of small classrooms and tutorials then. Such séances were often dramatic (with drinking glasses being lifted from Ouija boards and smashed by ‘spirits’ against the walls of these tutorial rooms), giving these black students the psychological energy to survive the alienating apartheid UCT of the time.⁹⁹

Even if we want to believe so, we are certainly not in a neutral space at UCT or anywhere else in higher education. In my own discourse on higher education, I am not as keen to use the tired term ‘de-colonial’, but rather ‘occupy’. The word ‘de-colonial’ is still presented as a ‘response’ rather than as a self-determined social agency. To occupy, is to *be*, to *claim* without explanation. The global intellectual occupy movement is activist scholarship that does not request listening, but *compels* it and thereby claiming and creating an ethos of belonging for the ‘minoritized’ and ‘peripherised’. It is part of the unfinished work of the TRC in ‘everyday’ South Africa. We have no choice now but to listen and to do it *genuinely*. Perhaps we need to talk about what this entails, this notion of ‘genuine listening’ beyond ‘voice’.

In an ‘engaged’ scholarship, we do not merely speak of ‘social responsiveness’ (suggesting dislocation and ‘out there’), we reclaim the space for all knowledge practices and processes where *Lalela* is valued and where notions of inferiority and superiority of knowledge are problematized to their very core - where indigenous perspectives are genuinely valued and are present. If implemented consciously by ourselves in our methods of teaching, and in our social networks of power and

⁹⁸ See for instance, paranormal ‘investigations’ into ‘haunting’ in the incarceration spaces at The Castle of Good Hope <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=v1CLZoOx334>. Its haunting is also posted as a blog on a South African official tourism site referring to ‘convicts’ who were once executed there. <http://www.southafrica.net/blog/en/posts/entry/5-of-the-spookiest-towns-in-sa>

⁹⁹ An account of a séance at UCT is narrated in the author’s semi-autobiographical account of her undergraduate student years in the early 80s (*Peeping Through the Reeds*, Authorhouse, UK, 2010).

recruitment, practising genuine *Lalela* will certainly go a long way to contribute to higher achievement rates amongst black and poorer students and contribute towards a peaceful, prosperous and harmonious society. (It is a published NRF imperative, for instance, to hire and train local staff and a published UCT transformation imperative to find innovative strategies to retain them as scholars, teachers and researchers.)

The *Lalela* framework for higher education teaching and self-reflective practice advocates a nurturing approach to education, and not a punitive and alienating one. It is essentially a form of ethical scholarship built on equal partnerships of knowledge production and in research. In saying this, I do recognise and respect that some of us do this already and have been doing so for many years.

We all know that academics are generally not trusted. We only need to look at all the literature in Anthropology and Sociology handbooks on dealing with 'suspicion', and how to build 'trust' in participative research etc. What can we share with each other on such strategies of scholarship intervention and occupation and how can we best share them? What do such interventions look like and how can they impact on institutional transformation / change? Is 'social responsiveness' a sufficient model? How can we prevent it from becoming yet another deficit model?

With surviving intergenerational trauma, comes creativity and innovation built on decades of experiential knowledge not just found in short term fieldwork and in institutional archives. Scholars who have survived societies in transition from warfare, genocide, apartheid, the Holocaust etc. have essentially important contributions to make in higher education pedagogy and teaching in general. How can we, for instance, strategically use the intellectual capital and networks of trust that the anti-apartheid Peoples Education activists (and who are often by historic default the once 'traumatised scholars') bring as agents of change in the present higher education occupy movement when some academic staff is said to be ill equipped to teach in revolutionary moments in ways that are informed by listening

strategies and skills? What are the useful capital and investment that such scholars (who are often themselves at the periphery) bring that can enhance research capacity and credibility to our work in a transforming and evolving higher education landscape?

Much of the 'new scholarship' draws on 'old' scholarship – such as understanding historical context, the long tradition of oppositional historiography¹⁰⁰, interdisciplinary methodologies (which were key to the Peoples Education movement of the 1980s, for example). This generation is also a huge archive of yet untapped experiential knowledge that has still not had the space to be applied systemically in the new South Africa.

Lalela scholarship will of necessity take longer, but it is undoubtedly more sustainable though it would require more patience and resources to implement. It is a form of restorative justice and healing. *Lalela* strategies through 'spatial and intellectual occupation' need not be violent. Odora-Hoppers speaks of 'negotiation' in spaces of higher education; for instance of 'shifting the terrain of antagonism and violence'. We all have the intellectual and constitutional responsibility to disrupt cycles of humiliation and enforced forgetting and imposed silences that cause further woundedness and indeed violence - to thereby turn these spaces into creative agencies of transformation.

In essence, I am arguing for a deeply transformed approach to scholarship engagement based on *Lalela* at UCT within its haunting Hoerikwaggo landscape; one which sensitively takes into account our respective histories and identities as well as the deep social-economic-political history of the Cape and its much entrenched legacies in woundedness.

¹⁰⁰ In a public address to black students by the author and Xolela Mangcu in 2015 at Forest Hill the students expressed surprise and dismay in learning about the historical construction of a 'Coloured' identity, the way the permit system worked during apartheid, the long and diverse tradition of anti-apartheid struggle etc.

More profoundly, it goes without saying that the concept of *Lalela*, as transformative listening in this regard, is in fact deeply buried in the principles of our Constitution and in our Bill of Rights. The present constitutional crisis in South Africa has illustrated a taunting dance with what is necessarily sacrosanct¹⁰¹ right now in terms of responsibility, values and accountability in our democracy.

In order to keep the university space open for debate and engagement (listening), we need to sacrifice our self-deception, we need to bury the 'ghost of Rhodes' in its various haunting formations and colonial 'shrouds', we need to converse with our co-dependent identities without which each of us and our knowledges are not complete.¹⁰²

What does it mean to really *listen to open up to approaches to scholarship and ways of knowing different to our own?*

The answer to this question is still tentative.

In affirming my own identity and belonging and those of many self-identified Khoi women as scholars rooted in the haunting UCT landscape (past and present), I'd like to quote from Toni Stuart's poem, 'The Woman Speaks':

'My breath is in the cloth that sets Hoerikwaggo's table...if you meet me in the Castle walls¹⁰³, know that my heart has already returned to the dunes...' ¹⁰⁴

In ending, I wish to urge in the spirit of *Lalela* (as a holistic intervention) for us to gently start the wise journey to consciously ensure that UCT is a place of scholarship for the belonging and retention of the many Krotoas and Sarah Baartmans in their ancestral and descendant diversity related to Hoerikwaggo, and not merely *about*

¹⁰¹ It is recognised that the Constitution is the product of a negotiated settlement and problematic for some in this regard.

¹⁰² See for instance Ari Sitas on the essential symbiotic nature of knowledge construction as a way forward in the Humanities. <http://mg.co.za/article/2012-04-26-way-forward-for-the-humanities>

¹⁰³ Also symbolic 'walls' of UCT

¹⁰⁴ From 'The Woman Speaks' by Toni Stuart.

them.¹⁰⁵ This will be a significant indicator of a genuinely transformed university as a site of engaged and relevant scholarship as part of Hoerikwaggo and would bode well for higher education transformation in South Africa where genuine listening is a sacrosanct value, central to our constitutionality.

Lalela.

¹⁰⁵ There has been a significant exit of Khoi-descendant women (who are UCT alumni) from the space. They have been welcomed at other universities. In conversation, they claim not being 'heard', being invisible, 'not being listened to' at UCT.